

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2024/0434
Valid 24/09/2024

GREENACRES GREEN
LANE
RUDYARD

PROPOSED SELF BUILD
REPLACEMENT DWELLING

(FULL - MINOR)

MAIN ISSUES

- Development in the Green Belt and Open Countryside
- Design
- Amenity

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The site currently consists of a white render and tile roof bungalow, and its associated curtilage, approx. 0.24 hectares. The site is in the Green Belt, approximately 600 metres north of the village of Rudyard. Immediately east of the site is the property known as Dorian, which used to be ancillary to Greenacres, however has been a standalone dwelling since at least 2005, according to Council Tax records. To the west, is a dormer bungalow, and to the north and south is agricultural land. The Horton 33 footpath runs along the southern boundary of the site. However it is not considered that this would be affected by the development.

The applicant has been granted prior approval for a second storey extension to the property under Schedule 2 Part 1 Class AA of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 (as amended). SMDC planning reference: HNT/2023/0017.

PROPOSAL

The application seeks permission to demolish the existing building and replace it with a two-storey red brick dwellinghouse with Staffordshire Blue roof tiles. The replacement dwelling will be approx. 4.77 metres to the eaves, and 7.66 metres to the roof ridge at the front elevation. The rear outrigger will be approx. 3.2 metres to the eaves, and 6.83 metres to the roof ridge, single storey with accommodation in the roof space.

Revised plans have been agreed, making amendments to the siting of the property as well as obscuring windows in order to improve neighbour amenity.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan (Adopted 2020)

SS1 Development Principles
SS2 Settlement Hierarchy

SS10 Other Rural Areas Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Paragraph(s) 1 -14, 47, 131, 135, 153 – 155.

Section(s) 4 – Decision making, 12 – Achieving well designed and beautiful places, 13 – Protecting Green Belt land.

Adopted Supplementary Planning Documents/Guidance (SPD/G):

- Design Principles for Development in the Staffordshire Moorlands
- Staffordshire Moorlands Design Guide SPD
- Space About Dwellings SPD

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

- HNT/2023/0017. DESCRIPTION: The proposal is for the construction of an additional storey on top of an existing bungalow. DECISION: HNT-PPNREQ.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: Expired
Neighbour consultation period ends: Expired
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

One objection, citing loss of privacy, highway access issues, design and visual impact, and amenity impact as main concerns regarding the proposed development.

Horton Parish Comments

No objection.

Staffordshire County Council Highways

Acceptance. It is considered the proposal will not have a detrimental impact on the highway and therefore no objection.

AES Waste

No issues regarding waste collections.

Canal and River Trust

No comment.

Public Access (Peak and Northern Footpaths Society)

Note that the Public Rights of Way Horton 33 is close to the proposed site.

The use of any PROWs, and the safety of users must not be affected by the development, nor during the work taking place.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

In accordance with Policies SS1 and SS2 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan the Council expects all new development to make a positive contribution towards the sustainability of communities and to protect and where possible enhance the environment. The site is in the Green Belt and has an existing Gross External Area (G.E.A.) of approximately 168.08m² and a volume of 568.33m³. Paragraph 154 d) states that *the replacement of a building, provided the new building is in the same use and not materially larger than the one it replaces* is considered exceptional development in the Green Belt. In this case, the G.E.A. for the proposed replacement building is approx. 121.53m², which represents a 27.7% reduction on the footprint of the original building. The volume of the proposal, however, is approx. 793.86m³, which represents a 39.68% increase on original. While this represents a significant increase in volume, as typically closer to around a 30% increase within the Green Belt is considered acceptable, the application has a strong fallback position as an additional 210.8m³ was granted under HNT/2023/0017, which allowed for an additional storey to be added to the property under Schedule 2 Part 1 Class AA of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 (as amended). This granted HNT permission could create a dwelling with a volume of approximately 779.13m³, which means the proposed development would only increase the volume on what has previously been granted permission by 1.86%.

Substantial weight is being given to the Permitted Development fallback position because it is considered that this is a realistic option for the applicant as it would achieve the same result as the proposal – a two storey detached family home. Furthermore, the proposal would occupy a footprint 27.7% smaller than the fallback if granted, and a de minimis increase in volume, as well as significant design benefits with the use of more traditional materials and architectural features. For this reason, it is considered that the proposed development amounts to very special circumstances and is acceptable development in the Green Belt.

The table below is included to help clarify the figures discussed above. All figures approximate:

	Existing	HNT/2023/0017	% difference	SMD/2024/0434	% difference
G.E.A.	168.08m ²	168.08m ²	0%	121.53m ²	-27.7%
Volume	568.33m ³	779.13m ³	+37.09%	793.86m ³	+39.68%; +1.86% above HNT/2023/0017

The proposed development must also comply with Local Plan policy SS10, as it is development in the open countryside, which states that the 'other rural areas' comprise the countryside and the green belt outside of the development boundaries of the towns and larger villages and the open countryside surrounding the smaller villages. These areas will provide only for development which has an essential need to be located in the countryside, which can be demonstrated by the fact it is a self-build replacement dwelling. The Council and its partners will achieve this through the following actions:

1. b. Allowing the conversion or replacement of an existing rural building in accordance with Policy H 1;

Paragraph 5 of Policy H1 states that in the other rural areas in the open countryside, only c) *Proposals for replacement dwellings, provided they do not have a significantly greater detrimental impact on the existing character of the rural area than the original dwelling or result in the loss of a building which is intrinsic to the character of the area*, will be permitted.

In this case, the proposed development is a replacement dwelling, and not considered to conflict with this policy, and is therefore compliant with Policy SS10, and acceptable development in the open countryside, in principle.

Design

SMDC Policy DC1 requires development to be of a high quality and add value to the local area, incorporating creativity, detailing and materials appropriate to the character of the area; and be designed to respect the site and its surroundings and promote a positive sense of place and identity through its scale, height, density, layout, siting, character and appearance.

Paragraphs 131 and 135 of the NPPF outline what is expected of good design and required for the development of high quality, beautiful places, and provides for a high standard of amenity for existing and future users.

Staffordshire Moorlands District Council's Design Principles SPG outlines the Council's expectations in respect of design and states that new dwellings should relate to existing buildings in terms of scale and proportion, massing and materials and should derive their inspiration from local tradition. The SPG also states that skyline sites should be avoided, however this site is already in use as a dwellinghouse, with prior approval to add an additional storey above, bringing the total height of the existing house to approx. 8.22 metres (HNT/2023/0017). As the proposed development is 7.66 metres to the roof ridge, it is considered that this proposal is a better alternative in regards to avoiding prominence on the skyline.

The site is located on a private track off Green Lane, along which are a number of dwellings, ranging from large stone farmhouses, to barn conversions, to white rendered dormer bungalows. There is not a specific building tradition which can be applied to the locality, and therefore a detached red brick and blue tile house with traditional proportions, as proposed, is considered acceptable in this locality as red

brick and Staffordshire Blue tiles are traditional local building materials. The proposed development also accrues design improvements upon the previously approved HNT/2023/0017. Therefore, it is considered acceptable in terms of design.

Amenity

Paragraph 135 f) of the NPPF seeks to secure a high standard of amenity for all existing and future users. Local Plan Policy DC1 requires development to achieve a satisfactory relationship to adjacent development and to not cause unacceptable effects by reason of visual intrusion, overlooking, shadowing, overbearing effect, noise, light pollution or other adverse impacts on local character and amenity.

The site is bounded by Dorian to the north east, and The Banks to the west. Revised plans have been agreed to aid neighbour amenity with The Banks by repositioning Green acres on the site thereby moving the property away from The Banks. The first floor west facing windows have also been made obscure glazed to prevent overlooking. There is a good degree of separation between the proposed development and the proposed siting of the replacement Dorian (SMD/2024/0433), as the siting of Dorian was also adjusted when Greenacres was moved. The windows on the east elevation of Greenacres would not overlook the principal garden area of Dorian, but rather the shared access and parking area. It is therefore considered that the proposed development is acceptable in terms of amenity.

Highway Safety

Paragraph 109 of the NPPF states that patterns of movement, streets, parking and other transport considerations are integral to the design of schemes and contribute to making high quality places. Policy T1 seeks to provide safe and sustainable access and ensure that development does not lead to an increase in on street parking. The site is accessed from an unadopted lane, of which only the first portion is metalled where it meets Green Lane, an unclassified highway subject to a 60mph limit. SCC Highways have not raised issues with the proposal, and the site can accommodate the parking requirements outlined in Appendix 2 of the SMDC Local Plan. The proposed development is therefore acceptable in terms of Highway Safety.

In regards to the access, neighbours have raised concerns regarding the private lane which access the site. The proposed development would replace an existing dwellinghouse, and it is considered that there would not be a material difference in the volume of traffic generated. Temporary additional traffic generated from a works vehicles which development is underway is not a valid planning consideration. The fact that the current dwelling has not been occupied and therefore not generating traffic for several years is also not a planning consideration as this is circumstantial and there is a legitimate fall-back whereby the dwelling could be brought back into use at any time with no further consent.

Biodiversity Net Gain

The applicant claims the Self Build BNG exemption. When asked, the architect confirmed that the applicants, Mr and Mrs Woodward, had primary design input into the design of Greenacres.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

On balance, the proposal amounts to very special circumstances for development in the Green Belt as while the total volume of the development is greater than that of the building it replaces, it is similar in volume to a realistic fallback position which was approved under HNT/2023/0017. The proposed scheme benefits from design improvements upon HNT/2023/0017 as the design and materials used in this scheme are more in keeping with traditional local design styles. There would not be an adverse impact on highway safety of neighbour amenity as a result of the scheme, and therefore the application is recommended for approval.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : APPROVE, subject to conditions.

Case Officer: Reuben Berriman

Recommendation Date: 02/04/2025

X *B.S. Haywood*

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council