

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2024/0418 Valid 26/09/2024	FABER ROMAN CATHOLIC PRIMARY SCHOOL COTTON LANE COTTON	LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR PROPOSED FABRIC REPAIRS TO EXISTING BUILDING CONSISTING OF REPLACEMENT LEAD SECRET GUTTERS, RE- BEDDING OF PARAPET, RE- BUILDING OF CHIMNEY AND NEW LININGS TO INTERNAL WALLS. (LISTED BUILDING CONSENT - ALTERATION)
---	---	--

MAIN ISSUES

- Heritage Asset – Listed Building

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

Faber RC Primary School is a Grade II listed building located in the settlement of Cotton. The Faber school listing description states:

‘School house and adjoining school. c1840, probably by Augustus Welby Northmore Pugin for the Talbot family of Cotton Hall. Ashlar, with steep pitched plain tile roof with coved eaves detail. Single gable and ridge stacks, rebuilt C20 in concrete block. Coped gables, with single gabled bellcote and cross to left. 2 storeys; 3 window range. Central C20 wooden porch covering original segmental pointed arched doorway and oak door. On each side, a flat headed window, reglazed late C20. To left, blocked doorway to through-passage. Above, central stair window with mullion. Above again, 2 through-eaves dormers, reglazed, with copied gables. Rear has central single light window flanked by 2-light windows, all reglazed. To right, segmental pointed door. Above, 3 gabled dormers, the central dormer single-light. INTERIOR: Plain rooms, with some original 6-panel and 4-panel doors. Stone fireplace with chamfered pointed arch. Winder stair with square newels and chamfered stick balusters.

School, red brick with ashlar dressings and plain tile roof with patterned ridge tiles. Single storey, 5 bays, divided by buttresses. Plinth, moulded eaves detail, external gable and central ridge stacks, formerly with stone shafts. Three C19 conical ventilators. Street front has to left a double plain sash. To right, four 2-light casements with stone mullions, and mainly with original glazing bars. All these windows have chamfered stone surrounds. Above, box dormer. To left, boundary wall to yard, now roofed in, with chamfered coping and plain sash. Rear has later

C19 and mid C20 single storey additions. INTERIOR: 2 classrooms with arch-braced open roofs on stone corbels, ceiled at collar level. Doors, doorways and stair balustrade identical to those of school house.'

PROPOSAL

Listed building consent is sought for a number of alterations. These consist of:

- Replacement of lead flashing to the roof and installation of lead lined secret gutters.
- Repointing the areas of the north and south gable with lime mortar
- Re-bedding and repointing of stone copings with lime mortar
- Rebuild concrete section of north chimney in new Hollington stone
- Installation of internal insulation on first floor
- Installation on ventilation grills

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Local Plan (adopted 9th September 2020)

SS1 Development Principles

SS2 Settlement Hierarchy

SS10 Other Rural Areas Area Strategy

DC1 Design Considerations

DC2 The Historic Environment

National Planning Policy Framework

Section 4

Section 12

Section 16

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SMD/2005/0542 Change of use of Greystones to school and internal alterations to both listed buildings APPROVED

SMD/2004/1512 External alterations to Listed Building (replacement fence)
APPROVED

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 30/10/2024

Neighbour consultation period ends: 17/10/2024

Press Advert: 30/10/2024

Public Comments

Support (0)

Objection (0)

Neither (1)

- Consultation of 'Greystones' unnecessary as dwelling no longer existing and has been incorporating to the school.
- Argument that the concrete section of the chimney is a later addition which should be removed, and not replaced. Also questions regarding the same treatment not being proposed for the second chimney stack.
- Damp issues regarding the south gable have been overlooked

Town / Parish Comments

Oakamoor PC – Support

Environmental Health

n/a

Staffordshire County Council Highways

n/a

Historic England

No comments to make

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

Paragraph 203 of the NPPF states that in determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of: a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation; b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

The application seeks listed building consent for alteration works to the Grade II listed building. The principle of development can therefore only be deemed acceptable if the proposed development sustains and enhances the heritage asset.

Design and heritage

Section 16 Paragraph 205 of the NPPF states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great

weight should be given to the asset's conservation. This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

LP Policy DC 2 states that the council will conserve and where possible enhance heritage assets, including their setting in a manner appropriate to their significance.

The application seeks to make a number of alterations to the roof of the listed building. These include replacement and installation of secrete lead gutters, repointing and re-bedding of stone copings. This will be done with lime mortar. The proposed works will not harm the building, and will help to prevent water ingress into the building. The works will not visually alter the appearance of the building.

It is further proposed to repoint sections of the north and south elevations with a lime mortar. This is considered acceptable and will not harm the heritage asset. It is proposed to remove concrete stones from the north chimney and replace these with Hollington stone. The proposed rebuilding, is intended to reduce water ingress while maintaining the existing external appearance. This is considered acceptable and will sustain the heritage asset.

The application proposes the internal insulation of the first floor and the installation of 6 ventilation grills (of cast iron) to ventilate the gap between the proposed insulation. A gypsum insulation is not typically considered acceptable for listed buildings, as this is a modern material, which can prevent solid walls from breathing as required. The proposed insulations follows the guidance of 'Energy Efficiency and Historic Buildings - Insulating Solid Walls' published by Historic England.

The proposed cast irons vents are proposed to ensure that the building continues to breath behind the insulation. This involves the removal of a number of original stone to install the cast iron vents. The cast iron vents are considered acceptable in appearance, and require minimal loss of original fabric. However, cumulatively the proposed insulation and vents are considered to lead to less than substantial harm to the listed building. As such some public benefit is required to outweigh the harm caused by the proposed insulation.

The proposed works seek to improve the conditions of the primary school, the design and assess statement (D&A) states that 'The works focus on ensuring the school maintains a safe and functional environment for students, staff, and visitors'. The D&A goes on to state that the first floor insulation will address 'an ongoing damp issue at first floor level which has caused unsafe mould to form on the surface causing damage to the internal wall faces; particularly to the gable walls of the first floor areas'. As such the proposed works are intended to, and will improve conditions for staff and students within the school, will ensuring that the school can remain open in a usable condition. As such this is considered to be a sufficient public benefit to outweigh the small amount of less than substantial harm caused. As such the works are considered acceptable.

Other Matters

Concerns have been raised regarding the necessity to rebuild the northern chimney, while not rebuilding the middle chimney. The proposed rebuilding of the northern chimney will maintain the visual appearance of the listed building, and will neither harm nor enhance the heritage asset. The proposed chimney work will instead sustain the heritage asset. The application does not propose any works to the second chimney, and the LPA have no authority to force the applicant to repeat the works to the second chimney.

Further concerns have been raised regarding damp on the southern gable of the listed building. The LPA are unable to insist upon this being addressed within the current application, however encourage the applicant to assess this. Some repointing is proposed for the south gable, which may be intended to assist in the damp at the southern end of the building.

Complaints have been raised regarding the consultation of 'Greystones'. 'Greystones' is the address of the former teachers lodging at the school, which has since been incorporated into the school building. Consultation are issued to all adjoining postal addresses, to ensure that all interested parties are notified. As such Greystones was mistakenly consulted.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

In conclusion, the proposed repointing, guttering improvements and chimney rebuild are considered to sustain the heritage asset and are therefore acceptable. The proposed internal insulation and vents will cause some less than substantial harm. However, this is outweighed by the public benefit of improving conditions within the school, allowing it to stay open without harm to staff or students. As such the proposed works are considered acceptable. As such the application is recommended for approval.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : Approval

Case Officer: Rachel Robinson

Recommendation Date: 19th November 2024

X *B.J. Haywood*

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council