

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2024/0416
Valid 18/09/2024

HODGEFIELDS FARM
LADYMOOR LANE
LADYMOOR GATE
BROWN EDGE

ANCILLARY RESIDENTIAL
ACCOMMODATION

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

- Whether the proposal comprises an exception to inappropriate development in the Green Belt
- Design
- Amenity
- Highway Safety

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The site comprises a detached stone and tile dwellinghouse and its associated curtilage, situated in the Brown Edge and Endon ward. An original outbuilding (attached to the main dwelling by an original stone wall) sits amongst the domestic curtilage of the site and a series of outbuildings and agricultural buildings belonging to the site owners are located to the West and South of the site. The proposed site is within an area of greenbelt, where development is more restricted. The site is blanketed by open greenbelt countryside land in all directions. The closest neighbouring dwelling at Lower Hodgefield, Ladymoor Lane is located approximately 145 metres to the South-West of the site. The Brown Edge 33 public right of way runs parallel with the Southern boundary of the site. The Ladymoor Lane highway runs adjacent to the proposed site on the East.

PROPOSAL

The proposed development comprises the provision for ancillary residential accommodation. The ancillary residential accommodation will be created through the use and extension of an existing outbuilding within the domestic curtilage of the site. The outbuilding is already linked to the host dwelling by an original stone wall. In replacement of the stone wall, a single storey link extension would be erected to allow internal access between the host dwelling and the ancillary accommodation.

An additional storey would be added to the original outbuilding in order to create sufficient space for the ancillary accommodation. To accommodate for the additional storey, the maximum height of the outbuilding would be raised to approximately 4.96 metres and the eaves height of the outbuilding would be increased to approximately 3.14 metres. The proposed link extension between the host dwelling and the ancillary accommodation would have a depth of approximately 3.90 metres and a

width of 2.50 metres. It would have a maximum height of approximately 2.90 metres and an eaves height of 2.20 metres.

It would be constructed from materials which would harmonise with the existing dwellinghouse, including natural stone and recycled slate tiles and timber with double glazing.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan (Adopted 2020)

SS1 Development Principles
1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
SS2 Settlement Hierarchy
SS10 Other Rural Areas Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Paragraph(s) 1 – 14
Section(s) 4 – Decision making, 12 – Achieving well designed places, 13 – Protecting Greenbelt Land

Staffordshire Moorlands Design Guide SPD

Part 5 – Alterations, Extensions and Conversions

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SMD/1983/0056 – Alterations and extensions to form bathroom and kitchen. Approved.
SMD/2019/0605 – Erection of carport. Approved.
SMD/2023/0036 – Replacement agricultural building to house livestock and store fodder and implements. Approved.
DOC/2021/0059 – Discharge of condition 4 in relation to SMD/2019/0605. Approved.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 13/11/2024
Neighbour consultation period ends: 25/10/2024
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

No public comments have been received.

Town / Parish Comments

At a meeting on Monday 7th October, Brown Edge Parish Council resolved to have no objection to this application.

Staffordshire County Council Highways

The proposal is for the conversion and alteration of an existing stone outbuilding (shown as office on the submitted Block Plan) into residential accommodation that will be ancillary to Hodgefields Farm. The proposed accommodation will have 2 floors and comprise of an open kitchen, living, dining room and 1 bedroom with wet room/WC above. It is proposed to construct a link between the proposed accommodation and the main house.

Access to the building will be via the existing vehicular access to Hodgefields Farm (off Ladymoor Lane).

Staffordshire Moorlands Parking Standards state for a property of up to 3 bedroom requires parking for 2 vehicles. Parking is not shown on the submitted plan however, it is considered there is sufficient parking for 2 vehicles within the curtilage of the property and can accommodate parking for both Hodgefields Farm and the proposed dwelling.

The proposal will not have a detrimental impact on the adopted highway and therefore there are no objections on Highway grounds to the proposed development subject to a condition.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

Paragraph 11 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) promotes a 'presumption in favour of sustainable development'. For decision takers this means (c) approving development proposals that accord with an up-to-date development plan without delay; or (d) where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are more important for determining the application are out-of-date, granting permission, unless: i) the application of policies in the Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed; or ii) Any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in the Framework taken as a whole.

Paragraph 8 of the NPPF identifies three dimensions to sustainable development as being economic, social and environmental.

In accordance with Policies SS1 and SS2 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan the Council expects all new development to make a positive contribution towards the sustainability of communities and to protect and where possible enhance the environment. A more limited focus on future growth is to be kept in smaller village settlements, including the outskirts of Brown Edge. When considering development proposals the Council will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).

The application site is located in the Open Countryside and Green Belt whereby Policy SS10 of the Local Plan (2020) is applicable. Policy SS10 states that these rural areas will provide only for development that has an essential need to be located in the countryside, supports the rural diversification and sustainability of the rural areas, promotes sustainable tourism or enhances the countryside.

Part (3) of policy SS10 seeks to protect the quality and character of the area and requires all development proposals to respect and respond sensitively to the distinctive qualities of the surrounding landscape.

Part (6) of Policy SS10 states that the Council will “maintain the Green Belt within Staffordshire Moorlands. Strict control will continue to be exercised over inappropriate development within the Green Belt allowing only for exceptions as defined by Government policy.”

Paragraph 154 of the NPPF (2023) outlines that the construction of new buildings should be regarded as inappropriate in the Green Belt unless it meets an exception. Paragraph 152 of the NPPF (2023) states that ‘inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances’. One such exception is (c) the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building.

Neither the Local Plan nor the NPPF (2023) provide a definition of what is regarded as being ‘disproportionate’ for the purposes of Green Belt policy. However, previous policy guidance considered a development resulting in a 30% increase in the size of the original building as being acceptable. Whilst it is acknowledged that 30% increase is not planning policy, it does represent a useful “rule of thumb”.

Initially, the combined existing and proposed extensions equated to an increase in volume of approximately 50%. The property has been previously extended, meaning that it had already nearly exceeded a 30% increase over the size of the original building. Whilst it is acknowledged that 30% increase is not planning policy, it does represent a useful “rule of thumb”. Notwithstanding this with the existing building already being extended, there can be no doubt that any further larger extensions will result in a disproportionate addition over and above the size of the original building. Furthermore, the proposed two storey link extension would create a disproportionate visual appearance, in addition to the purely volumetric assessment above.

This resulted in harm to the Green Belt by way of inappropriateness and harm to

openness and should not be allowed unless there are very special circumstances to outweigh that harm. No such circumstances were put forward or identified.

Suggestion was made by the Council to the applicants that a solution could be to reduce the link extension to being single storey, in order to reduce impact on the greenbelt as a result of the proposed development. Following the submission of revised plans, the proposed extension would now equate to an increase in volume of approximately 45%. Although the combined extensions to the property would exceed the 30% guideline, the Council do not consider that the extension would result in a disproportionate addition over and above the size of the original building, as it would not exceed the guideline so substantially. The revised design ensures that the main house appears visually separate from the outbuilding, even with the ground floor link. Thus, spatially the extended area does not undermine openness, despite it creating a 45% increase.

It is now necessary to identify whether there is any other harm arising from the proposed development.

Design

Policy DC1 seeks to ensure that all development is well designed and of a high quality, contributing to local distinctiveness and harmonising with sense of place. The Council's Design SPD outlines the Council's expectations in respect of design and states that extensions should harmonise with the parent building. An extension should respect the dominance of the original building and be subordinate to it in terms of its size and massing.

The dwellinghouse and outbuilding are both visible from the highway / amongst the street scene, therefore the design of the proposed development needs to be sensitive to the surrounding area. Although the proposed extension would add an additional storey to the existing outbuilding, the proposed extension would reflect the style of the existing building in terms of the pitched roof to compliment the pitched roof of the outbuilding and dwellinghouse. The eaves and maximum heights of the proposed outbuilding would continue to be set down from the parent dwelling despite the addition of the first storey, as well as follow the course of the original outbuilding, thus it would be considered appropriate development in accordance with the Council's Design SPD.

The proposed link extension between the host dwelling and the ancillary residential accommodation would remain subordinate to the host dwelling, due to its single storey nature. Proportionately, the link extension would ensure subservience of the proposed extensions comparatively with the host dwellinghouse. The single storey link extension would also aid in ensuring that the main house appears visually separate from the outbuilding, further reducing the visual prominence of the extension from the highway.

Materials used in the construction of the proposed extension would match those used in the construction of the existing dwelling, as well as from surrounding

dwelling in the area. Natural stone, re-use slate plus recycled slate tiles and timber double glazed windows would be used in the construction of the proposed ancillary accommodation extension. Thus, the proposed materials would match the existing materials and harmonise with the host dwelling, not detracting from the character of the host dwelling.

The proposal, by virtue of its size, scale and siting would maintain the character of the existing dwelling and area. The proposal would therefore accord with the provisions of local plan policy DC1 and section 12 of the NPPF in this regard.

Amenity

Paragraph 130 f) of the NPPF seeks to secure a high standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants. Local Plan Policy DC1 requires development to achieve a satisfactory relationship to adjacent development and to not cause unacceptable effects by reason of visual intrusion, overlooking, shadowing, overbearing effect, noise, light pollution or other adverse impacts on local character and amenity.

The site is completely blanketed by open greenbelt countryside land. The closest neighbouring dwelling at Lower Hodgefield, Ladymoor Lane is located approximately 145 metres to the South of the site, thus it is clear that no light or privacy amenity impact would occur for any neighbours as a result of the proposed development.

Highway Safety

Paragraph 104 of the NPPF states that patterns of movement, streets, parking and other transport considerations are integral to the design of schemes and contribute to making high quality places. Policy T1 seeks to provide safe and sustainable access and ensure that development does not lead to an increase in on street parking.

The proposed extension for ancillary accommodation would increase the number of bedrooms of the dwelling. Although this means that an additional off-highway parking space will be required for the number of people inhabiting the dwellinghouse, the large driveway to the front of the dwelling would easily accommodate for this. Additionally, the proposed extended area would not compromise the available off road parking within the front curtilage of the dwelling, in compliance with Policy T1.

Thus, the proposed extension would have no impact on highway safety, in accordance with Policy T1.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

In consideration of all of the above, the application is recommended for approval. Due to the application having no adverse effect upon neighbour or street scene amenity, less than substantial impact on the openness of greenbelt and no overall impact on the highway, it is deemed acceptable under planning policy. Therefore, the

proposed ancillary residential accommodation extension is recommended for approval, subject to compliance with all conditions.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE

Case Officer: Hannah Varley

Recommendation Date: 11/11/2024

X *B.J. Haywood*

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council