

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2023/0592
Valid 29/11/2023

WOODSIDE COTTAGE
FARLEY ROAD
OAKAMoor

**TWO STOREY REAR AND
SIDE EXTENSION REPLACING
TWO STOREY RED BRICK
EXISTING EXTENSION AND
GARAGE.**

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

Impact on the character and appearance of the area

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

Woodside Cottage is in an isolated countryside location surrounded by high quality landscape. It has access with Farley Road via a 200m length of unmade track, half a kilometre south of Oakamoor Village.

Woodside Cottage, originally Wood Cottage Farm, has its origins as a late 18th or early 19th century linear plan farmstead. It is listed as such on the County Council's historic environment record. To that extent the property is a non-designated heritage asset.

The dwelling has a very wide front and rear elevation on a slim linear footprint, it appears that the original cottage adjoined a farm shippon and outbuildings and all of the structure has been absorbed to provide the current layout of living accommodation.

The cottage and farmstead has been built against the steeply rising hillside behind to the north. The stone cottage faces southwest across open garden, toward woodland valley and rising hillside beyond. Its rear elevation backs onto a narrow yard and the rising hillside to the north. On the exposed northwest end/side elevation, the cottage resolves to the subordinate form of a single storey gabled brick outrigger that presents to the access drive.

For the purposes of the SMDC Local Plan the dwelling is located in an 'other rural area' of countryside that surrounds the nearby villages, within this context the cottage is relatively remote and isolated. The cottage appears within and contributes to the local landscape that is identified in the document 'Landscape and Settlement Character Assessment of Staffordshire Moorlands' (LSCA) as being of a 'Dissected sandstone cloughs and valleys' landscape type. A landscape that has the 'highest of sensitivity'.

PROPOSAL

A proposal to enlarge the dwelling with a two storey addition to the north west facing side wall of the dwelling. The addition would replace the existing brick outrigger and extend a further 2.5m to the side (a total of 6m from original stone side wall of dwelling). The additions would be built using matching facing stone and plain roof tiles.

At ground floor level the side addition would also extend 4m from the front elevation to the south. This would create a 6m wide flat roofed ground floor area and a total side elevation at ground floor, exposed on the end of the dwelling, of 8m.

Originally submitted plans included a proposal to turn the proposed flat roof into a roof terrace to be enclosed by a glass panel balustrade and a first floor patio access would have been provided within a wide stone dormer gable that would have cut into the roof plain behind.

A revised plan 'G' was submitted on the 31st Jan. The revision omits from the scheme the roof terrace, balustrade and stone gable dormer. It introduces a tiled shallow hipped dummy pitched roof that would sit around the edge of the proposed flat roof.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Local Plan Development Plan Document (Adopted 2020)

S01 Spatial Objectives
SS1 Development Principles
SS10 Other Rural Area
DC1 Design Considerations
DC2 Historic Environment
DC3 Landscape Character

SMDC Design Guide
Landscape and Settlement Character Assessment
Planning for Landscape Change SPG

National Planning Policy Framework

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

94/01103/OLD Conversion of redundant adjoining outbuilding. APPROVED.
SMD/2008/0175 Single Storey Extension. APPROVED.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 31/01/2023
Neighbour consultation period ends: 31/01/2023
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

None

Town / Parish Comments

Oakamoor PC: Awaited

Staffordshire County Council Highways

No Objection. The property will remain a 4 bed house. The development would not result in the loss of parking spaces. The given distance of the property from the highway parking at the dwelling would not impact on the adopted highway.

Severn Trent

No public sewers at the property shown on statutory sewer records.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

The site is an 'other rural area' where local plan strategy SS10 applies. These areas will provide only for development which has an essential need to be located in the countryside, supports the rural diversification and sustainability of the rural areas. This will be achieved through meeting housing requirement and specific needs by, inter alia, supporting well designed householder development to meet the needs of a home owner, permitting 'extensions or additional domestic outbuildings to existing dwellings provided they are appropriate in scale and design and do not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwelling and the character of the rural area. The Council will assess schemes having regard to the original dwelling, in cases where cumulative change has occurred.'

Design and Impact on Character and Appearance of the Area

Policy DC1 of the Local Plan requires all development to be well designed and reinforce local distinctiveness by positively contributing to and complementing the special character and heritage of the area in line with the Council's Design Guide SPD. In particular, the policy requires the development to be of a high quality and add value to the local area, incorporating materials appropriate to the character of the area.

The SPD guidance says that *"The key to a sensitive approach is to take note of what is there already before preparing the design and to work with the building's character. An extension should respect the dominance of the original building and be subordinate to it in terms of its size and massing. Setting back the new section from the building line and keeping the eaves and ridge lower than the parent building will help"... "New buildings should use facing materials that either match or complement those of the surroundings"*.

The site is in the countryside and an area of local landscape identified as having the qualities and characteristics of a 'Dissected sandstone cloughs and valleys' landscape type. A landscape that has the 'highest of sensitivity'. Within this landscape, deeply incised wooded valleys with narrow winding watercourses, stone buildings and walls, large broad leaf woodlands, and narrow sunken lanes with hedge banks, all form key characteristics.

Under the terms of local plan policy DC3 local landscape will be protected and, where possible, enhanced by resisting development which would lead to prominent intrusion into the countryside and supporting development which respects and enhances local landscape character.

The existing dwelling presents a wide fronted rural stone cottage on slim linear footprint, it is of obvious age and traditionally rural character. On approach from the north west it is the dwelling's side/end elevation that is most exposed and prominent,

from the south across open garden the dwelling's front elevation is most exposed and prominent.

Despite the location of the adjacent neighbour at Woodside View, from the north and west the applicant's dwelling appears uniquely as an isolated dwelling, without the architectural continuity of a built grouping or street scene to provide context or reference. The dwelling sits, on its own merits, neatly within the setting of high quality surrounding landscape. The dwelling contributes to and provides visual interest and foreground within a high quality local landscape.

The sensitivities and qualities here, therefore, can be identified as being that of the uniquely attractive dwelling and the contribution it makes to the quality of the highly valued local landscape (comprising many of those features identified as being key characteristics in the LSCA for this character type), the distinctiveness of the locality, and the character and appearance of the area. Significant alteration or enlargement of the existing dwelling would disrupt and be harmful to the proportions, character and appearance of the dwelling and its relationship between the dwelling and the landscape and the character and appearance of the area.

Specifically here:

- The two storey end gable would dominate the prominent, exposed side elevation, the end of the dwelling would no longer resolve in subordinate form, the addition would not relate well or respect the scale and character of the original dwelling.
- The ground floor flat roof addition would make for a very wide and dominant side elevation at ground floor that would be insensitive to the dwellings character and origins, this elevation is exposed and most prominent on approach from the north west. It would make for a very bulky and unattractive form of development in this position. In these regards the development would make a prominent intrusion into the countryside.
- The flat roof addition on the front south facing elevation would in design terms be a poor quality functional addition that would not relate well to the character, form and roof arrangement of the original dwelling. The addition would appear overly bulky and disrupt the linear form of the dwelling on a principal, exposed elevation. Adding the shallow hipped dummy pitch to the edge of the flat roof would not assist in these matters. The shallow roof would have odd proportions and a style of roof that would not relate to that of the original dwelling and would appear somewhat contrived. This would not mitigate the harms identified above.

The development would be harmful to the character and appearance of the area and local landscape. The proposal would not comply with policies SS10, DC1 and DC3 of the Adopted Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan 2020 and the Design Guide 2018 for the area.

Impacts on the Heritage Asset

Woodside Cottage, originally Wood Cottage Farm, has its origins as a late 18th or early 19th century linear plan farmstead. It is listed as such on the County Council's historic environment record. To that extent the property is a non-designated heritage asset.

The NPPF requires the effect of an application on the significance of a non-designated heritage asset to be taken into account in determining the application. In weighing applications that directly or indirectly affect non-designated heritage assets, a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage asset.

The prevailing form of the linear farmstead remains largely unaltered respecting its 18th/19th century origins. As a traditional largely unaltered farmstead it contributes to the heritage and character of the historic environment, a relatively rare surviving example. The significance of the asset is that of historic farmstead on a linear layout. The proposed development would disrupt and break the linear form of the building, with bulky poorly related development, this would result in a confused and awkward arrangement of building shape that would be considerably harmful to the significance of the heritage asset. In these regards the development would be contrary to policy DC2 of the SMDC Local Plan and the terms of the NPPF.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

The proposal does not represent good design that would be respectful of the original dwelling's size, scale, linear form, character, proportions, and its relationship with the local landscape. The proposed additions would introduce shape, size, and mass that would be at odds with the original dwelling and overly dominant on exposed and prominent elevations. The harmful development would detract from the positive quality contribution that the dwelling currently makes to the character and appearance of a quality local landscape and the significance of a non-designated heritage asset. This would fail to reinforce local distinctiveness and be harmful to the character and appearance of the area. In these respects the development would be contrary to policies SS10, DC1, DC2 and DC3 of the Adopted Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan 2020, the Design Guide 2018 for the area, and the terms of the NPPF.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : REFUSE

Case Officer: Ben Hurst

Recommendation Date: 9th February 2024

X *B.J. Haywood*

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council

