

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2023/0195
Valid 28/04/2023

**THE COTTAGE MARTEN
HILL
SWINSCOE**

**DOUBLE STOREY SIDE AND
REAR EXTENSION.
CONSTRUCTION OF NEW
DETACHED OAK FRAMED
CAR PORT. NEW NON-
POROUS DRIVEWAY FINISH.**

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

- ☐ Principle of Development
- ☐ Impact on the character of the house and area
- ☐ Amenity
- ☐ Parking

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The site is located in open countryside to the north of the 'smaller village' of Swinscoe, landscape character identified as 'Dissected sandstone cloughs and valleys'. The original 19th Century double fronted cottage has a principal front elevation that is at right angles to the road looking on to a small garden, while its side gable is parallel and faces the roadside. The dwelling is red brick but some of the side, field facing elevation has been painted white. The other, south west facing, side elevation faces open farmland with small scale irregular field parcels that are enclosed by tree lines and traditional hedgerow.

The dwelling has been extended at the rear with a two storey addition that adds to the rear gable projection, pursuant to planning consent 2021 planning consent. This runs parallel to the road. 150m to the south east of the site and 130m to the north west, Parish Footpath 36 and 37 respectively, run at right angles from the road. The hedgerow and tree lined field boundaries screen the side and garden areas of the dwelling from view.

PROPOSAL

A pitched roof side extension adding to the existing gable end which projects to the north west and adding a two storey extension to the existing projecting rear element to the south west. The part of the extension which is parallel to the road will have a lower roof ridge than the existing ridge. The addition would extend 3.0m from the existing building. The ridge height will be 5.9m which is 300mm lower than the existing ridge the extension will be 6.0m deep. The south west facing extension will

be 5.2m wide by 1.8m deep. The extension is proposed to be part render part brick with a pitched roof

A detach garage type structure will be added to the west. This will be partly open sided with gabled roof. It measures 3.8m high by 4.7m wide and 6.2m deep.

Amendments to the design was requested, revised plans were received but they did not respond to all the points raised in the request for amendments.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Local Plan Development Plan Document (Adopted 2020)

S01 Spatial Objectives

SS1 Development Principles

SS10 Other Rural Area

DC1 Design Considerations

National Planning Policy Framework

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

88/00281/OLD Extensions to rear. Approved.

SMD/2020/0391 Extensions to side and rear. Withdrawn.

SMD/2021/0023 Two storey rear extension and change of use to extend garden. Approved.

SMD/2021/0380 Side Extension - Approved

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 1 June 2023

Neighbour consultation period ends: 25 May 23

Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

None received.

Blore with Swinscoe Parish Council - Meeting supports this application but would like to be assured that the drainage - septic tank and surface water - are upgraded in order to cope with the additional accommodation.

Severn Trent Water – Indicate that a informative should be added to any approval.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

The site is within a 'Other Rural Area' to the northern edge of the 'smaller village' hamlet settlement of Swinscoe. The Local Plan strategy for these areas (SS10) is to provide only for development which has an essential need to be located in the countryside, achieved through, 'inter alia', meeting housing requirements and

specific needs. This specifically, might include allowing extensions to existing dwellings provided they are appropriate in scale and design and do not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwelling and the character of the rural area. The Local Planning Authority will assess schemes having regard to the original dwelling, in cases where cumulative change has occurred.

Design and Impact on character and appearance

To accord with the strategy an extension to an existing dwelling must be appropriate in scale and design and not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwelling and the character of the rural area. Supplementary to this, local plan design policy DC1 requires development to be well designed and reinforce local distinctiveness by positively contributing to and complementing the special character of an area in line with the Council's Design Guide SPD. With regard to 'extensions', the design guide requires them to harmonise with the parent building, respect the dominance of the original building and be subordinate to it in terms of its size and massing, as an example, setting back the new section from the building line and keeping the eaves and ridge lower than the parent building will help (paragraph 5.5). Paragraph 5.8 sets out that "Irrespective of size, however, all buildings can reach a threshold beyond which further extension is just not possible without destroying their character."

Paragraph 130 of the NPPF states that development should function well and add to the overall quality of the area, not just for the short term but over the lifetime of the development. Paragraph 134 sets out that development that is not well designed should be refused, especially where it fails to reflect local design policies, taking into account any local design guidance.

The dwelling has already been extended significantly at the side / rear, yet the origins of the dwelling (a simple, modestly sized double fronted cottage) remained relatively intact at the eastern end of the house, where they form the south east facing elevation. In these respects, the extensions which extends to the side and the rear in a way that is subordinate and respectful to the original form and character of the dwelling.

The additional proposed extension with this application would significantly elongate the rear of the dwelling to an unacceptable level. The extension would add to the mass of the rear projecting element of the property significantly extending the rear projection. The house would appear to have an original rear projection which is 6.6 deep. The previous extension added 5.3m to this extending the ridge significantly and this will add a further 3.0m to this element. This addition result in a long rear projection visible from the road which will add a disproportionate addition to rear of the house unbalancing the property and causing both harm to the house and to the character of the area. While the extension has been set down to a height below the ridge of the original house this reduction in mass would only have limited effect on the visual appearance of the extension.

The original floor area (pre 1988) of the house is calculated at approximately 114sqm. The proposed floor area of the extensions which have been added to the house if this permission was implemented would be approximately 150sqm. Clearly this scale of addition would add a cumulative disproportionate addition to the house which will cause harm to the character of the property.

The proposal would also change the south east facing extension. It will add two new gables to the two that have already been built pursuant to the 2021 consent and introduce large first floor windows which are not in keeping with the character of the original house or with the extensions to the house. While this elevation is not prominent from the main road, its design is at odds with the existing form, resulting in an unattractive elevation with an excessive number of gable ends facing south west and the introduction of oversized apex windows at first floor. The introduction of two further gables, and their extent across the whole elevation would introduce design features which are alien to the character of the dwelling. The dwelling is already partly rendered and so the expansion of the rendering of the dwelling is considered to be acceptable as it is part of the existing character of the building. Overall, the extension would, in addition to those already constructed amount to a disproportionate and visually poor addition to the dwelling, to the detriment of the character of the host dwelling and the wider countryside.

The garage structure is relatively modest in size and the design / materials used are of a rural character. While it is clearly visible from the road it is not considered to cause harm to the character of the area or the setting of the house

Amenity

There are no neighbouring properties within 150m of the applicant's dwelling. No issues are raised here, the extension would not overlook any private amenity space enjoyed by neighbours.

Highway Safety

The development would increase the number of bedrooms by one. Within the site there is parking and turning space to comply with standards (3 off road spaces), including the new car port. No changes are proposed to the existing access arrangements and therefore no highway safety concerns would arise.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

It is concluded therefore that the proposed extension would have a detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the house and the area. The revised proposal does not accord with Policies SS10 and DC1 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan, which collectively seek to ensure that new development respects local character and integrates with its surroundings. It would also fail to comply with the Staffordshire Moorlands Design Guide SPD, and the design objectives of the Framework.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : Refusal

Case Officer: Alan Lynch

Recommendation Date: 15/08/2023

X *J. Colley*

Signed by: Jane Colley Signature

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council