

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2022/0083	HAREGATE HALL	RESTORATION AND REPAIRS
SMD/2022/0084	HAREGATE ROAD	TO HAREGATE HALL,
Valid 01/03/2022	LEEK	CONVERSION AND
		ALTERATION OF EXISTING
		OUTBUILDINGS TO FORM
		3NO. DWELLINGS, ERECTION
		OF 2NO. DWELLINGS AND
		ASSOCIATED WORKS
		(FULL – MINOR & LISTED
		BUILDING CONSENT)

MAIN ISSUES

- Impact on the significance of designated heritage assets, the character and appearance of the area, and the amenity of neighbours.

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The application site lies within the defined settlement boundary of Leek and extends to approximately 0.44 hectares in area. The site is dominated by the Grade II Listed Haregate Hall which dates back to the 17th / 18th Century, and which has been occupied as three individual dwellings since the early 1960s.

A garden and remains of an enclosing wall are located to the immediate west/southwest of the Hall, with a more extensive area of garden extending to its north and east, wrapping behind an existing terrace of four bungalows (nos.87 – 93 Haregate Road).

To the west of the Hall lie two brick and stone barns of two storey scale which date from the 18th / 19th century and which form a group with the house. A vacant and partially overgrown area of hardstanding is located to the south of those buildings, and which is enclosed to its west and south by Osprey Close and Haregate Road respectively. To the northwest of the Hall lie a cluster of 19no. dwellings constructed in 2015 by Ascent Housing, of which some wrap along the northern/northwestern perimeters of the site. Those dwellings are modern in appearance, two storey in scale, and have their rear elevations and rear gardens facing towards the site. A right of access exists along Osprey Close to enter the application site in its northernmost corner.

To the west of the site, on the opposite side of Osprey Close, lies an area of public open space beyond which extends further residential development. Residential development also lies to the southwest, south, southeast and east of the site. A triangular parcel of land in the far eastern corner of the site appears to have been erroneously allocated as part of the Thorncliffe View public open space within the

adopted Local Plan. This land is not public open space, nor visual open space; not does it have any form of public accessibility. It forms part of the original established garden surrounding the Hall.

PROPOSAL

Repairs to fabric of main Hall, including demolition of link between the hall and The Kitchen House as detailed in the Schedule of Works accompanying the application). The building is to be retained as three individual dwellings, which are known as The West Wing (Old Hall), The East Wing (New Hall) and the Kitchen Cottage.

Conversion and alteration of existing two storey outbuilding adjacent to Osprey Close to form 2no. dwellings – referred to as West Barn 1 and West Barn 2. The barns will have a gross internal floor area of 99 square metres and 91.5 square metres respectively, and will each comprise of three bedrooms, bathroom and hallway at ground floor, with an open plan kitchen / dining / living area and w.c. at first floor. Externally it is proposed to create an area of private amenity space to the west of the buildings, enclosed by a new brick wall for privacy, with a shared courtyard in front. Parking is to be provided in a shared parking area to the southeast of the barns.

Conversion and alteration of existing two storey outbuilding adjacent to the walled garden of the Hall to form 1no. dwelling. The dwelling will have a gross internal floor area of 133 square metres and will comprise of an open plan lounge / kitchen / dining room, utility, entrance hall and two bedrooms served by a 'jack and jill' ensuite at ground floor with a master bedroom and ensuite at first floor. Externally it is proposed to create an area of private amenity space to the east of the buildings, with parking incorporated to the south of the building as part of a shared parking area.

Erection of 1no. dwelling to the south of the existing outbuildings adjacent to Osprey Close. The dwelling will have a gross internal floor area of 95 square metres and will comprise of an open plan lounge / kitchen / dining room, two bedrooms, bathroom, w.c. and hallway at ground floor with a master bedroom and ensuite at first floor. Externally it is proposed to create an area of private amenity space to the east of the buildings, with parking incorporated into the shared car parking area to the east.

Erection of 1no. dwelling to northeast of existing Hall within part of its garden area. The dwelling will have a gross internal floor area of 133 square metres and will comprise of an open plan lounge / kitchen / dining room, two bedrooms, bathroom and hallway at ground floor with a master bedroom and ensuite located at first floor. The dwelling will sit within its own area of private amenity space, with an area of car parking located to its southwest, served by a new vehicular access off Haregate Road, which will also provide access for parking for one of the existing dwellings within the Hall.

Construction of detached garage to the rear of the Hall to provide parking for occupants of the Old Hall, served via a shared access off Osprey Close in the northwest corner of the site.

Formation of new vehicular access off Haregate Road to serve the four dwellings comprised within the two redundant outbuildings, and the new build dwelling at the corner of Osprey Close with Haregate Road.

Revised Plans

Revisions were requested and supplied to:

Introduce tiled roof and masonry facing materials to be used on the new barn constructions.

Change of detailing on the north west side elevation of Haregate Hall – the roof changed to a simple tiled gable at first floor height to the slim side addition and the zinc wrap of the ground floor addition changed to a simple flat roof structure with glazed panels and sections of masonry.

Amendments to the proposed side addition to kitchen cottage – glazed link between cottage and addition, masonry facing material as opposed to cladding, and introduction of stronger masonry pillar at ground floor corner.

A vertical first floor window introduced to west elevation of the new house to break and add detail to the blank elevation.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Local Plan Development Plan Document (Adopted 2020)

S01 Spatial Objectives
SS1 Development Principles
SS5 Leek Area Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
DC2 Heritage Assets
DC3 Landscape and Settlement Setting
NE1 Biodiversity/Ecology
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

SMDC Design Guide 2018

National Planning Policy Framework

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SMD/2014/0178 Fabric repair, alteration and refurbishment including new boundary walls and new parking area to the rear. Reinstating the link between the 17th Century part of the building and C18th Century to form one dwelling. Internal layout alterations to the North. APPROVED.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 29th April 2022

Neighbour consultation period ends: 29th April 2022

Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

None

Town / Parish Comments

Leek Town Council: Not unneighbourly, bat roosts should not be removed

Environmental Health

No objection. Potential for there to be some contaminated material from historic uses asbestos from old buildings, fuel tanks and fly tipping etc. Full pre development investigation would be onerous, suggested conditions relative to discovery of material and importation of material.

Waste Collection

No Objection

Severn Trent

No Objection subject to drainage condition

Tree Officer

The applicant's agent has submitted some further information in relation to tree protection issues, and I have the following additional/updated comments:

An Arboricultural Method Statement (AMS), together with a Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) and associated "Proposed Phasing and Site Set Up Plan" have been submitted which, inter alia, address tree protection and construction access/materials storage etc during the construction period – these being issues previously raised.

- The AMS acceptably details positions and specifications for temporary tree protection barriers.
- The AMS acceptably details a specification for a no-dig cellular confinement load spreading system for the construction/installation of the drive/parking area to Kitchen Cottage, which encroaches within the Root Protection Area (RPA) of Yew tree T6 to the north.
- The CEMP and Site Set Up Plan confirm the position of construction access points, materials delivery points, construction plant storage area, and site parking and site welfare positions – these are all shown to be located outside the RPAs of all retained trees.

Conservation Officer

No objection following agreed revisions.

Staffordshire County Council Highways

No Objection subject to conditions. Haregate Road is an existing residential area. Osprey Close is a recently constructed residential development. Conversion of the outbuildings and construction of new dwellings would not be unreasonable in this location. The proposal is unlikely to have a severe effect on the highway. East Barn, West Barn 1 and 2 and the new build have shared parking area of 6 spaces (drg 2051 AL03 E). To meet parking standards, these 4 dwellings require 8 parking spaces.

There is a shortfall of 2 spaces. However, I understand that on balance, this shortfall is acceptable to the LPA. Access to the rear of the development, West Wing, Kitchen Cottage, garage, through Osprey Close involves access outside the red line across third party land. It is noted that this is already the case. The applicant should ensure they have appropriate rights and permissions to use this access and should confer these onto future purchasers. Two new accesses are proposed. Details of the extent of the proposed accesses and their effect on the highway keystone will be required for construction and approval of S184. It would be preferable for this to be done at this stage to avoid delay at S184 stage.

Two existing access areas made redundant by this development. These are not shown on the existing or proposed drawings. Revised drawings are required showing these redundant accesses and details of proposals to permanently reinstate them. Current records show that there were no Personal Injury Collisions on Haregate Road within 50m either side of the property accesses in the previous five years.

Severn Trent

No objections. Suggest drainage condition requiring approval of scheme for disposal of foul and surface water. There is a public 300mm surface water sewer located within this site. Public sewers have statutory protection and may not be built close to, directly over or be diverted without consent. You are advised to contact Severn Trent Water to discuss the proposals. Severn Trent will seek to assist in obtaining a solution which protects both the public sewer and the building.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

It does not appear that the 2014 planning permission to convert the three dwellings at Haregate Hall into one was ever implemented. For all intent and purposes therefore Haregate Hall already provides three separate dwellings – West wing, East wing, and kitchen cottage (the works and development would improve these dwellings with refurbishment and some enlargement and, in the case of kitchen cottage, its division and separation from the hall). Additionally the proposal would provide a further 5 dwellings with the conversion of three existing barns within the grounds, the erection of an adjacent replica barn conversion, and the erection of a detached dwelling set to the east on land within the ownership.

The site is within the Leek Town development boundary as defined by the adopted Local Plan and is largely surrounded by other residential development. Here the Local Plan area strategy SS5 applies. Generally the strategy is supportive of development delivering housing to increase the range of available and affordable house types.

However, currently the Council cannot demonstrate a 5 year housing land supply. Therefore, the policies which are most important for determining the appeal are considered to be out of date. Paragraph 11d of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) is engaged. This states that permission should be granted unless i. the application of policies in this Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed. Those policies include the protection of designated heritage assets. This matter is considered below.

Design and impact on the character and appearance of the area and the heritage asset.

In many respects the proposal presents opportunity to restore and make use of large redundant buildings within the site with improvements to the condition and appearance of the premises overall, a site which, particularly at its peripheries is deteriorating and showing signs of abandonment and the beginnings of dereliction. The development, works and reuse would make purpose of the redundant barns sensitively employing existing openings to function as three dwellings without enlargement or significant alteration. The south west corner of the site to the peripheries of the barns, bounded by the junction of Osprey Close with Haregate Road, is exposed and open. The land's edges lack definition and it is susceptible to scrub and a scruffy appearance. In this corner area, the application proposes the construction of a small replica barn conversion to provide a fourth dwelling (two storey accommodation in a gabled structure with further living space in ground floor space hidden below boundary wall). The fourth dwelling would take up some of the underused open space and together with a walled parking area provide definition and purpose to the area.

To a large extent, the Haregate Hall site is surrounded by more recent suburban housing development. However, the land to the northeast is undeveloped running to open farmland and countryside landscape views toward the Roaches and this is significant to the setting of the Hall. Within this land, to the east the application proposes the erection of a fifth new dwelling. This would to some extent affect the setting of the listed building. However, the new dwelling would be set remote from the Hall leaving a swathe of open garden or paddock land surrounding the Hall, the dwelling would be placed within the extreme eastern end of the ownership. The design would achieve a dwelling with largely low profile single storey accommodation set behind a stone boundary wall – limiting the extent to which structure and height would interrupt views toward and from the Hall. The narrow gabled two storey element is designed to have an almost agrarian appearance within the landscape. Any limited harm to the setting of the Hall and the significance of the asset would be less than substantial. The applicant is committed to funding repair and refurbishment of the listed building and contribution from the development would assist, and moreover, the contribution to housing supply in a town centre sustainable location would outweigh that limited harm as a public benefit.

Treatment of the three pre existing dwellings at Haregate Hall includes some alteration and enlargement. The form of the three dwellings would be essentially respected, however, the scheme includes the removal of a poor quality connecting link between Kitchen Cottage and Haregate Hall to separate them, the enlargement of kitchen cottage with a side addition, and the alteration and enlargement of a side addition to East Wing of Haregate Hall.

The alteration at the side of East Wing would improve the form and arrangement of slim, poor quality addition to the side of the listed building and add a glazed porch at ground floor that would remain clearly distinct from the main building and light in structure. An addition to the side of Kitchen Cottage, with revisions, would have a glazed link making it distinct and separate from the listed building. Material improvements have strengthened a corner pillar.

Overall, any limited harm to the setting of the Hall and the significance of the asset would be less than substantial. The applicant is committed to funding repair and refurbishment of the listed building and contribution from the development would assist, and moreover, the contribution to housing supply in a town centre sustainable location would outweigh that limited harm as a public benefit.

Impact on the amenity of existing neighbours and the living conditions of future occupiers

The new dwelling to be built in land to the east of the hall would be built behind the rear elevations and gardens of the four bungalows that front Haregate Road (87-93). The design of the dwelling would largely retain a single storey low profile set behind what would appear externally as a boundary stone wall. The wall would be 12m from the bungalow's rear elevations and windows. Council Space About Dwellings guidance suggests a separation distance of 11m between windows and a single storey blank facing wall, the arrangement here therefore would be compliant and the neighbour's outlook would be perceptibly be toward boundary wall in the middle distance. Behind just one of the bungalows, no. 91, a single two storey gabled turret would appear above the wall. Set in from the stone enclosure the rear of the structure would be 14m from the bungalows rear facing windows. Space About Dwellings guidance suggests a separation distance of 14m between principal window and two storey blank facing elevation. The applicant has also provided a cross section that demonstrates that the height of the proposed structure would neither breach a 23 degree or 45 degree vertical sight line taken from the centre of the window facing forward toward the structure. The new dwelling would be surrounded by ample amenity ground with outlook to the open ground to the north.

The Kitchen Cottage dwelling already has windows on its rear elevation that give outlook over 'west wing' yard area and toward the rear gardens of the dwellings on Osprey Close. The proposed addition to the side would introduce a small bedroom window at first floor and two living room windows at ground floor. Those ground floor windows would look onto boundary feature within close proximity, and consequently the rooms are also served by significant window openings on the gable end and front elevation that look onto areas of the dwellings own open curtilage space. The new windows would be 8m from the Osprey Close garden boundaries and have an indirect relationship with their rear elevations at a slightly more oblique orientation than right angles to the rear of Kitchen Cottage, the distance between first floor windows would be roughly 13m. In many respects this is a pre existing situation, and the development would not introduce any significantly greater overlooking. The very indirect angle between windows assists and prevents any obvious window to window line of sight between habitable rooms. Normally, a standard compliant first floor window would be at least 11m from rear garden boundary and there would seem to be the potential for the neighbour's small garden to be overlooked. This first floor window could be obscure glazed with considerable outlook provided on other elevations.

The relationship between Kitchen Cottage and the Haregate Hall dwellings is pre existing and with the removal of the connection and the division of the two the amenity relationship would see some improvement. The end gable or side elevation that would remain facing the hall would be blank facing. The new windows to the front of the

proposed Kitchen Cottage addition should not cause anymore overlook above that of the pre existing situation.

The arrangement around and relationship between the three 'barn dwellings' is relative creative and in some respects might be considered 'tight' against Council Space About Dwelling guidance. The 'front' elevations of west barn and east barn would face each other across an open shared yard area and stand 11m apart. As a barn conversion project this is dictated by the position of the existing buildings. Space About Dwellings guidance require a distance of 21m between opposing principal windows. The scheme appears alert to this 'shortfall' and proposes a creative window and room arrangement to minimise overlooking. The wide cart openings in the front of the west barn dwellings would be respected and glazed sections would largely serve hallways, stairways and bedroom 3, as opposed to principal/habitable rooms. The facing elevation at East Barn (west elevation) would creatively use a timber clad wall with glazed reveals to provide treatment to its largest existing cart opening. The elevation would include a first floor bedroom 3 window, a shower room window and a small dining room window, thus limiting principal outlook. The rear of East Barn would have a patio window opening onto a small patio walled garden and presumably have a share of the open yard to the front. The West Barn dwellings would have a small roadside yard area to the rear and a share of the yard to the front.

The new 'replica barn conversion dwelling' would primarily have outlook to the front, the ground floor at the rear and side would be enclosed by boundary wall and a small first floor window would look across the highway and playing fields behind. The front outlook would face onto a small enclosed garden and the shared parking area.

Overall, any shortfall in amenity standard for future occupiers or impact on the living conditions of neighbours would not amount to adverse impacts that would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits of providing contribution to housing supply and securing the refurbishment and reuse of heritage assets.

Ecology

The application was submitted with a Bat activity survey report relative to the Hall and barns. The report finds and acknowledges the presence of roosting bats. The survey makes recommendations with regard to a mitigation strategy, primarily flagging the requirement for a bat license from Natural England before much of the work can be carried out. Compliance with such a license would require mitigation measures and the report and proposed scheme offers the provision of alternative accommodation within integrated bat lofts within some of the buildings.

Highway Safety

See the comments of the highway authority provided and copied above.

The elements to the northern edge of the development - Kitchen Cottage and West Wing would have access that joins the private shared drive at the end of Osprey Close, to the north, and crosses a triangle of rough scrub land that is outside of the red edge. The rough land has a compacted stone track surface. This would provide access to a pull in parking area for two to three cars to the north of Kitchen Cottage and an open courtyard and double garage to the rear of west wing.

As a three bed dwelling there would be at least two (standard compliant) spaces available within courtyard and garage for the West Wing dwelling. Kitchen cottage a large two bed dwelling would also be allocated at least (standard compliant) 2 spaces.

To the south of the development two new accesses would be constructed onto Haregate Road. At the western end of the development an access from Haregate Road would turn into a shared parking area for the three barn conversions and the replica barn (East barn 3 beds, West barn 1 & 2 both 3 beds, Replica barn 2 beds). Parking standards would require 8 spaces, two per dwelling. In total the shared area would provide just six spaces – a short fall. However, on balance the small shortfall enables the sensitive treatment of the site, delivery of economic benefit to assist with the refurbishment of the heritage assets and delivers four new dwellings in a residential town location. The shortfall would not amount to an adverse impact that would outweigh the benefits associated with the development.

At the eastern end of the development the repositioning of the access and driveway for the east wing would provide a shared drive and access to the East wing and the new dwelling on land to the east. East wing, a 2/3 bed, would have two parking spaces as a pull in to the side elevation (similar to existing arrangement). The new dwelling a 3 bed would also have two parking spaces allocated.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

The redevelopment project would restore and refurbish a designated heritage asset. It would deliver a contribution to house supply with the conversion and reuse of existing buildings that would some extent fund works to the listed building. With revision the design of new buildings, conversion and alteration would be of acceptable design and a creative use of the site which on balance would have benefits that would not be outweighed by any adverse impacts.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : APPROVE PLANNING PERMISSION AND LISTED BUILDING CONSENT

Case Officer: Ben Hurst

Recommendation Date: 14th June 2023

X 

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council