

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2022/0276
Valid 26/05/2022

GREENFIELDS, THORNEY
EDGE ROAD, BAGNALL,
STAFFORDSHIRE, ST9 9LA

RETENTION OF SINGLE
STOREY EXTENSION TO
DWELLING

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

- Whether the proposal comprises an exception to inappropriate development in the Green Belt.
- Impact on the character and appearance of the existing dwellinghouse and the surrounding area.
- Impact on neighbouring amenity.
- Impact on highway safety

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The application site is located in the North Staffordshire Green Belt. The application falls to be assessed in terms of policy SS10 of the Local Plan and national planning advice relating to development in Green Belts, Chapter 13 Protecting Green Belt Land within the NPPF (2021).

The site is adjacent to an existing farmhouse, a brick and Staffordshire blue tiles finished farmhouse converted from a former barn, with agricultural buildings and amongst buildings associated to the established livery business that operates at the site.

The application is retrospective and comprises a single storey brick and slate extension connected to the existing farmhouse by a canopy. The scale, material finish and design reflects the character of the existing dwelling.

The extension accommodates ancillary living accommodation in the form of an enclosed bathroom and a single open plan room constructed in an “L” shaped layout. The open plan room has full height glazed doors and window across each elevation allowing the space to flood with light. The room is currently furnished with sofas, dining table and chairs and a second seating area.

The farmhouse sits to the east of Thorney Edge Road and accessed down a long track/driveway (approximately 430m from the road). It is screened from public view from Thorney Edge Road by the treelined road and agricultural/equine buildings. The site is surrounded by open countryside and a number of properties/farm complexes that access onto Thorney Edge Road. To the north of the site is a large sub station complex.

For the purposes of planning policy consideration, the application site is located within the Cheddleton Ward. The property is not located within a Conservation Area and there are no Listed Buildings/structures or protected trees which need to be considered.

PROPOSAL

This is a retrospective application. Full planning permission is sought for the extension to the dwelling.

The single storey dual-apex pitched roofed “L” shaped extension includes: a large open plan living space and separate bathroom. A canopy roof link joins what is effectively an outbuilding. The material finish matches the main farmhouse and the rear elevation is predominantly glazed.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan (Adopted September 2020)

SS1 Development Principles
1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
SS2 Settlement Hierarchy
SS10 Other Rural Areas Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport
Appendix 2 Parking Guidance

Supplementary Planning Guidance

1. Space About Dwellings
2. Design Principles for Development in the Staffordshire Moorlands: New Dwellings and Extensions to Dwellings.

Supplementary Planning Document

1. Staffordshire Moorlands Design Guide

National Planning Policy Framework

Including sections
12: Achieving well-designed places
13: Protecting Green Belt Land

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SMD/2021/0496	Land at, Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Bagnall, Staffordshire, ST9 9LA	Proposed development: solar farm of approximately 1.5MW with energy storage capacity of up	Screening Opinion - EIA Not Required	10/09/2021
-------------------------------	---	--	--------------------------------------	------------

		to 57MW on 4.25 hectares of land at Greenfields Farm, ST9 9LA		
SMD/2021/0382	Land at, Greenfields, Thorney Edge Road, Bagnall, Staffordshire, ST9 9LA	Screening Opinion for a proposed construction and operation of an energy storage facility.	Application Withdrawn	
DET/2019/0009	Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Bagnall, Staffordshire, ST9 9LA	To house suckler cows and rearing cattle and dry feedstuffs.	Prior Approval Granted	30/07/2021
SMD/2007/0678	Greenfields Farm, Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Temporary approval to site caravan during building works to existing farm	Planning Permission - Approved (Prior Oct 2013)	20/11/2007

SMD/2007/0030	Greenfields, Greenfields, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Conversion of Outbuildings to Residential	Planning Permission - Approved (Prior Oct 2013)	24/04/2007
SMD/2006/1123	Greenfields Farm, Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Conversion of outbuildings to residential	Planning Permission - Refused (Prior Oct 2013)	29/12/2006

SMD/2006/0483	Greenfields Farm, Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Replacement dwelling and demolition of existing outbuildings and shippon	Planning Permission - Refused (Prior Oct 2013)	03/07/2006
SMD/2006/0463	Greenfields, Greenfields, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Agricultural building	Planning Permission - Refused (Prior Oct 2013)	03/05/2006
SMD/2006/0117	Greenfields, Greenfields, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Erection of 50 livery stables	Planning Permission - Refused (Prior Oct 2013)	05/04/2006

SMD/2004/1286	Greenfields Farm, Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Agricultural building	Planning Permission - Approved (Prior Oct 2013)	26/10/2004
SMD/2004/0541	Greenfields Farm, Greenfields Farm, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Erection of three agricultural buildings (part retrospective)	Planning Permission - Approved (Prior Oct 2013)	23/09/2004
SMD/2004/0035	Greenfields, Greenfields, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire	Replacement dwelling	Planning Permission - Refused (Prior Oct 2013)	12/05/2004

	Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA			
SMD/2003/0820	Greenfields, Greenfields, Thorney Edge Road, Staffordshire Moorlands, Bagnall, ST9 9LA	Use of land as 3 x 9 hole golf courses, alteration, extension and conversion of existing farmhouse into club house and driving range, conversion of existing workshop into maintenance/storage facilities and carpark.	Planning Permission - Refused (Prior Oct 2013)	24/02/2004

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 5 July 2022

Neighbour consultation period ends: 4 July 2022

Public Comments

No representations received during the determination period.

A letter of Support is submitted in Appendix A of the Planning Statement from the occupant of a neighbouring farm - Newfields Farm, Rownall Road, Wetley Rocks.

Town / Parish Comments – Cheddleton Parish Council

Object – The site lies within the greenbelt and a retrospective application where permission should have been granted prior to works.

Staffordshire County Council Highways

There are no objections on Highway grounds to the proposal subject to the following condition: -

1. The extension associated with the existing dwelling and indicated on the approved Drawing Ref: 1777-AL01A shall remain ancillary to Greenfields and shall at no time be sold, let or converted to independent living accommodation without prior approval of the Local Planning Authority.

REASONS:

To comply with NPPF; to comply with SMDC Core Strategy Policy DC1 and T1; in the interests of highway safety.

Severn Trent Water

No comments received during the determination period.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development – Green Belt

The Framework identifies that the fundamental aim of Green Belt policy is to prevent urban sprawl by keeping land permanently open; the essential characteristics of Green Belts are their openness and their permanence. It goes on to state that inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances.

The Framework states that the construction of new buildings should be regarded as inappropriate development in the Green Belt, subject to a number of exceptions. The applicant contends that the proposal would meet one of the exceptions, namely c) the extension or alteration of a building in that that would not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building.

Policy SS10, states that proposals for development in the Green Belt will be determined in accordance with relevant national policy.

In relation to exception c), the Framework and Policy SS10 do not provide a definition of what constitutes a disproportionate addition over and above the size of the original building. In the determination of the application the Council used guidance within its House Extensions and Garages Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document.

The SPD states that “extensions will be permitted in the green belt only where it is shown that the scale, location and design would not detract from the open character and visual amenity of the green belt” It goes on to advise that “in Green Belts house extensions that extend the ground floor area of the original house by more than 50% will not normally be permitted unless there is an exceptional household need.”

The original property has been subject of modest extension since conversion, which saw the removal of permitted development rights (a response to retain control over the appropriateness and quality of future development).

The Council details that the ground floor area of the ‘original farmhouse building’ as 362.5m². The retrospective extension is detailed by the Council as adding 93m², and the existing porch 6.25m². As a cumulative result of previous extensions and the proposed is now 453.75m² – an increase of 91.25m², or **27.6%**.

There were some discrepancies with both the Council’s and agent’s calculations as the agent considers there to be a difference of 35%.

Notwithstanding, even at the higher figure, in considering what constitutes a disproportionate addition it is also necessary to consider the layout, scale, bulk, massing and built form of the extension already built relative to the size of the original building. In this instance the additional extension is screened by the massing of existing buildings or viewed against them as a backdrop, it is limited and relates well to the existing farmhouse building.

The layout, design, height, depth and mass of the built extension assimilates well when compared to that of the original dwelling. The additional volume is not visible across open land to the rear nor from the adjacent road.

On balance, the proposal would not result in a disproportionate addition over and above the size of the original building.

Accordingly, I conclude that the proposal would meet exception c) of Paragraph 149 of the Framework and would not conflict with Policy SS10 of the SMLP. As such, it would not be inappropriate development in the Green Belt, having regard to the Framework and any relevant development plan policies.

Design & Visual Impact

Policy DC1 refers to design and seeks to secure development of a high quality which is designed to add value to the area and to respect the site and its surroundings. New development should promote a positive sense of place and identity through its scale, density, layout, siting, landscaping, character, and appearance.

Paragraph 130 of the NPPF (2021) requires the design of a development to add to the overall quality of an area, by being sympathetic to local character and by being visually attractive as a result of good architecture.

The Council's Design SPD outlines the Council's expectations in respect of design and states that extensions should harmonise with the parent building. An extension should respect the dominance of the original building and be subordinate to it in terms of its size and massing.

The extension incorporates a brick and Staffordshire Blue tiled finish. These elements of the design complement the existing dwelling. The Council does consider that extensions should emulate the style of the original building, the Design SPD stipulates that in terms of style and materials extensions should show an honest recognition of the building's evolution and retain its historic integrity. In this instance, the extension assimilates seamlessly in terms of materials, scale, mass and complements the original dwelling by responding to the scale and character of the host dwelling and as such, accords with Policy DC1 in the Local Plan.

It is for these reasons that the retrospective extension complies with policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020) and the NPPF (2021).

Amenity

Policy DC1 seek to secure development that protects amenity, including residential amenity, in terms of satisfactory daylight, sunlight, outlook, privacy and soft landscaping.

The site is within a rural setting There are no residential properties in close proximity to the extension. It will comply with policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020) and the NPPF (2021).

Highway Safety and Parking

Policies DC1 and T1 seek to achieve a level of parking and an access that is appropriate to the development it serves.

The site is approximately 430 metres down a private drive with substantial area for parking, there are no highway issues arising from the development. The proposal will not have a detrimental impact on the adopted highway. This application is therefore considered to be in accordance with Policy T1 of the Local Plan.

The extension is for ancillary accommodation and indicated on the approved Drawing Ref: 1777-AL01A for occupants of the dwelling only. The extension associated with the existing dwelling shall remain ancillary living space to Greenfields and a condition will be imposed to secure this, stating that shall at no time be sold, let or converted to independent living accommodation without prior approval of the Local Planning Authority. This is in order to comply with NPPF; to comply with SMDC Core Strategy Policies SS10 and DC1 and T1.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

The extension will not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original dwellinghouse. It would not significantly harm the character and appearance of the host property.

For the reasons outlined above, it is recommended that planning permission is approved subject to conditions.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION:

Conditional Approval

Case Officer: P. Twigg

Recommendation Date: 6/7/2022

X 

Signed by: Jane Colley Signature

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council