

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2022/0395
Valid 14/07/2022

BARN
HAYES GATE FARM STAR
BANK
OAKAMoor

DEMOLITION OF EXISTING
STEEL FRAMED
AGRICULTURAL BUILDING TO
PROVIDE PURPOSE BUILT
GARAGE AND
AGRICULTURAL MACHINERY
STORE, SOLAR ARRAY AND
BATTERY STORE.

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

- Impact on character and appearance and ecology

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

Prior approval was granted at appeal to convert and use a large barn that sits centrally on the site as a dwellinghouse (DET/2018/0002) a new planning permission was later granted with a differing plans condition to allow for amendments to the scheme, not yet carried out or implemented. Also on site with close proximity and relationship, as part of the same physical arrangement, there is a small stone outbuilding to the east and a wide open fronted portal frame shed, adjacent, to the north east.

This little group of three buildings are served by a farm track that has access with Star Bank to the west. The track provides access for Hayes Gate Cottage before continuing another 30m to the east. The track terminates at the buildings and there is open woodland beyond. The track coincides with the public footpath that passes through the middle of the site between buildings providing walkers with access to the countryside beyond.

PROPOSAL

A planning permission already exists to repair the open fronted portal frame shed to provide sheltered/covered parking for the dwelling.

This application proposes the complete replacement of that shed with an entirely new larger portal frame building that would be built over its footprint.

The existing shed is open fronted. It has a mono pitch roof sloping from front to back. It has a footprint 5.5m by 19.5m and a maximum height of 4.6m on the high side and 3.8m on the low side. The replacement shed would be fully enclosed with two roller shutter doors on the side elevation and one large roller shutter on the gable end. It would have a footprint of 7m by 22.2m. It would have a full pitched roof with an eaves height of 4.4m and a ridge at 6.5m. The roof would accommodate a solar array on the southern facing slope.

The application statement confirms that the site is no longer used for farming but insists there is still a need to manage the land and as such, the proposed building includes provision for a modest agricultural store within the building.

Overall the new building would provide domestic garage, agricultural machinery store, solar array and battery store.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Local Plan Development Plan Document (Adopted 2020)

S01 Spatial Objectives
SS1 Development Principles
SS10 Other Rural Area Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
DC3 Landscape Character
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

DET/2017/0030 Class Q Prior Approval. Refused.
DET/2018/0002 Class Q Prior Approval. Allowed at appeal.
SMD/2019/0187 Variation of Class Q plans condition. Allowed.
SMD/2019/0453 stone barn to ancillary accommodation and farm shed to parking.
Approved.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 16th Aug 2022
Neighbour consultation period ends: 16th Aug 2022
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

None

Town / Parish Comments

Cotton Parish Council: No Objection

Ramblers Association

No Objection

Staffordshire County Council Highways

No Objection

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

The dwellinghouse has recently been provided within a contemporary portal frame shed that sits centrally on the site with a relatively low roof profile, as development permitted under Class Q of Part 3 of the GPDO 2015.

The open portal frame shed has close proximity and arrangement with the central barn/new dwelling and there is already a planning permission in place to alter and improve the building and to use it for the covered parking of motor vehicles. However, rather than simply propose the use of the existing structure within the planning unit, this application proposes its complete replacement with an entirely new larger building.

For the purposes of the Staffs Moorlands Local Plan, the site is within an 'other rural area' of countryside that surrounds the smaller villages. The applicable Local Plan strategy SS10 provides *only* for development that has an essential need to be located in the countryside, supports rural diversification and economy, promotes sustainable tourism or enhances the countryside. This to be achieved through actions that, inter alia, meet housing needs by allowing conversion of a building in accordance with policy H1 (permitting residential use where the building is suitable and worthy in character terms) and allowing additional domestic outbuildings to existing dwellings provided they are appropriate in scale and design and do not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwelling and the character of the rural area; and, in respect of sustaining the rural economy, enables limited expansion or development of business where a rural location can be justified or supports the diversification of existing farm enterprise.

The strategy therefore, would provide for a domestic outbuilding or garage at a dwellinghouse where it results from the appropriate reuse of an existing building (as per existing permission) or, in the case of a new build, appropriate in scale and design relative to the dwellinghouse and the character of the area.

As a domestic outbuilding or garage the building would be significantly larger than the dwellinghouse it would serve, dominating the scale and form of the dwelling-detrimental to the character, arrangement and appearance of the site and that of the dwellinghouse as the principle building on the site. Where the building would be used to store farm machinery, this is relative to the maintenance of a small land holding and not connected to any enterprise or support for the rural economy, as confirmed in the application statement. Both of the applicant's needs are in these respects adequately served by the existing shed which is subservient in its simple form, structure and design. There is no special justification for the much larger replacement building.

As such, there is no specific support for the development within the strategy at SS10 of the Local Plan. Any merit through the provision of renewal energy from a solar array would not outweigh these objections to the principle of the development.

Design and Impact on the Character and Appearance of the Area

The existing portal frame shed is already sizeable, however, its simple form and structure – mono pitch roof and open front maintain a subservient relationship with the

adjacent dwelling which, with its architectural detailing and use of material is clearly the principal building on site. From the roadside the dwelling appears on a raised foundation platform which increases its height against the adjacent farm shed which appears in the foreground, but at a lower level. The existing approval permits some alteration to improve its condition and appearance while retaining its character and appearance as an agricultural shed with timber cladding, sheet roofing and concrete block base.



The buildings of the residential unit appear against the background of the Ramshorn Common woodland.

The design consideration policy DC1 of the LP requires “all development to be well designed and reinforce local distinctiveness by positively contributing to and complementing the special character of the area in line with the Council’s Design Guide SPD” particularly “new development should be of high quality and add value to the local area, incorporating creativity, detailing and materials appropriate to the character of the area”. The adopted Design Guide SPD gives specific guidance on the provision of garages “These need to be designed and built in sympathy with the properties they serve. Materials and roof pitch should generally match those of the

parent building...Garages must be subordinate with material and roof pitch that match the dwelling”.

The proposed, replacement building would not comply with the LP policy or the Design Guide – it would be a large, purely functional, building that would, from the road, dominate the foreground, presence and setting of the adjacent dwelling and conceal and interrupt views of a band of woodland to the rear.

Policy DC3 of the LP applies to Landscape and Settlement Setting. The policy states that “the Council will protect and, where possible, enhance local landscape.....by: Resisting development which would lead to prominent intrusion into the countryside”. The residential unit is positioned at a point of transition between two landscape character types. The unit is located within an area character type identified in the LSCA as being that of ‘Gritstone Highland Fringe’, while the edge of the ‘Dissected sandstone cloughs and valleys’ character type, surrounds the property coinciding with its boundaries to the south east and north east.

This means that the buildings of the unit sit within and to the edge of an open pattern of plateaued rectangular field parcels with broadleaf woodland on rising ground immediately to the south east.

From the roadside and the public footpath approach from the north west the new building with its significantly larger gable end and height profile, resulting from a broader width and full pitched roof, would appear as a prominent intrusion in the countryside. With the appearance of a large black profile clad commercial or industrial building – with closed sides and roller shutter doors, the building would appear alien and obtrusive in the landscape. The building would conceal parts and dominate views of the woodland behind.

From the north west, walkers using the footpath on approach to Ramshorn common beyond, should pass traditional farmstead and a small cluster of former farm buildings, before entering the woodland. The view and amenity of this approach and the experience of the areas character would be harmed by the dominant presence of the new large building, that would need to be negotiated, before enjoying the amenity of the common.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

Overall there would be significant harm to the local landscape and the character and appearance of the rural area because the development would be of a size, scale, character and appearance that would not relate to the existing dwelling or protect and enhance the local landscape and distinctiveness of the area. Accordingly the development fails to comply with policies SS1, SS10, DC1 and DC3 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan 2020, the adopted Design Guide 2018, and the terms of the National Planning Policy Framework.

A contribution to renewal energy through the provision of a solar array on the building’s roof would not be a matter that outweighs those harms identified.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : REFUSE

Case Officer: Ben Hurst

Recommendation Date: 8th September 2022

X *B.J. Haywood*

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council