

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2022/0016
Valid 12/01/2022

DELL HOUSE COTTON
DELL
OAKAMoor

REPLACEMENT WINDOWS
AND DOORS.

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

- Heritage
- Design
- Amenity

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The proposed site comprises a detached brick, render and tile dwellinghouse and its associated curtilage, situated in the Churnet ward. Additionally, the proposed site is within the Churnet Valley Masterplan Boundary, where the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan seeks to concentrate rural regeneration. Dell House is located within the Oakamoor conservation area, although not detailed as a positive building, meaning that it is of a lesser significance to the conservation area as opposed to some surrounding buildings. The site is enclosed by neighbouring dwellinghouses on the North-West and South-West. Brambley Dell, Cotton Dell is situated to the South-West of the site. The side curtilage of the site runs parallel to the curtilage of The Glen, Carr Bank to the North-West. Peggy's and Bath Woods, a Staffordshire Moorlands Ancient woodland, is located to the North-East of the site. The Cotton Dell highway runs adjacent to the proposed site on the East.

It is noted that a number of properties within the estate have been extended and altered; however the established character of the original estate has been retained.

PROPOSAL

The proposed development consists of replacement windows and doors on all elevations of the dwellinghouse. The existing windows and doors are largely painted timber, combined with a number of white UPVC windows which have been introduced. The proposed windows shall be like for like with the existing windows in terms of their design and positioning, and shall be white / cream in colour. They will all be constructed from UPVC. The proposed replacement doors shall be timber composite finished in black.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan (Adopted 2020)

SS1 Development Principles
SS1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
SS2 Settlement Hierarchy
SS9 Smaller Villages Area Strategy
SS10 Other Rural Areas Area Strategy
SS11 Churnet Valley Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
DC2 The Historic Environment
DC3 Landscape and Settlement Setting
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Paragraph(s) 1 – 14;
Section(s) 4 – Decision making; 11 – Making effective use of land; 12 – Achieving well-designed places; 15 – Conserving and enhancing the natural environment; 16 – Conserving and enhancing the historic environment.

Other documents

- Oakamoor Conservation Area Appraisal – July 2016
- Oakamoor Conservation Area Article 4 designation
- SMDC Design Guide SPD adopted 21st February 2018

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SMD/1978/0931 – Erection of a garden store. Approved.
SMD/1981/0639 – Two storey extension to form larger kitchen and bedroom.
Approved.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 09/03/2022
Neighbour consultation period ends: 16/02/2022
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

One public comment of support has been received, stating that they have no objections to the proposed works.

Town / Parish Comments

Oakamoor Parish Council support the application.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

Paragraph 11 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) promotes a 'presumption in favour of sustainable development'. For decision takers this means (c) approving development proposals that accord with an up-to-date development plan without delay; or (d) where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are more important for determining the application are out-of-date, granting permission, unless: i) the application of policies in the Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed; or ii) Any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in the Framework taken as a whole.

Paragraph 8 of the NPPF identifies three dimensions to sustainable development as being economic, social and environmental.

In accordance with Policies SS1 and SS2 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan the Council expects all new development to make a positive contribution towards the sustainability of communities and to protect and where possible enhance the environment. A more limited focus on future growth is to be directed to smaller villages, including Oakamoor, only allowing for development of an appropriate nature. When considering development proposals the Council will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).

In compliance with Policy SS9, smaller village settlements should only settle for appropriate development which enhances community vitality or that meets a social or economic need of the settlement and its hinterland. The site lies within the smaller village of Oakamoor, where all new development will have the aim of reflecting and enhancing the special character and heritage of the village.

The proposed site is within the Churnet Valley Masterplan Boundary, where any development should be of a scale and nature and of a high standard of design which conserves and enhances the heritage, landscape and biodiversity of an area. Furthermore, the proposed development would be acceptable, subject to conformity with other relevant national and local planning policies. The main issues which need to be considered as part of the assessment of the proposed works include heritage, design and neighbour amenity.

Heritage

The adopted Oakamoor Conservation Area Character Appraisal identifies three

character sub-areas and the application site is within Area 1: Carr Bank, Cotton Brook and Churnet View Road.

The Conservation Area appraisal states:

“The Square was one of three purpose-built terraced rows, in a planned area of housing. The Square was built in two terraces running perpendicular to each other, one south-east facing, overlooking the Cotton Brook, the other south-west facing, overlooking the River Churnet, the pattern dictated by the brook and the need to provide some private space for privies and for growing vegetables. They have a spacious setting.”

The row of six cottages forming Starwood Terrace – adjacent to the application site – is stated as being roughly contemporary with the Square. They are dated to probably the turn of the 18th/ 19th centuries.

The area is described as having a mix of styles which are “restrained in character”.

Referring to the lane along the easterly side of the application site (rear of Starwood Terrace), the appraisal describes buildings at the foot of Cotton Dell as being:

“...well integrated into the surrounding historic settlement. These include a group of three modern bungalows. Along Star Bank, Delmere and Old Bank Cottage share quirky outbuildings. There is an ephemeral village charm to the back lane leading alongside the Cotton Brook, along which there are an assortment of garden sheds and individual timber garden buildings, some slightly ramshackle and some lovingly constructed, all contributing a quirky character to the lane.”

The Village Hall (1876-77) adjacent South-West of the application site is one of ten buildings put forward as worthy of inclusion on a local list of heritage assets.

It became the village hall in 1959. The building was built immediately adjacent to the earlier Methodist chapel of 1860, which is why it still has a plain elevation to the north; it retains much of its original character. The southern elevation and gable end to the road were, therefore, the principal elevations, with an engaged chimney flue to the roadside gable and buttresses dividing the bays. These elevations contain the large windows needed for a large schoolroom, set high above a large plinth, to avoid distractions, (the large raked dormer is a later alteration). The building is a local landmark, with buff coloured gritstone and contrasting dressings from the locally quarried, dark pink gritstone.

Does the proposal preserve or enhance the Conservation Area?

The conservation area appraisal describes how the “geology and structure of the steep-sided valleys creates a visual envelope, which contains many of the most dramatic views, combining both groups and isolated buildings with the dense tree canopy.” The “spacious setting” is noted to be the core part of the village – the village hall, Starwood Terrace, the war memorial garden opposite and the right angled terrace known as The Square. A ready conclusion in assessing this proposal is that the open view from the bridge between the hall and the terrace to the rising

wooded backdrop of countryside beyond is a very notable contributing factor to the overall sense of the village's character. There are other notable viewpoints but this one, at a very public central point in the village, can reasonably be considered to be of significant value in defining the village's setting. Although it is not specifically mentioned in the conservation area appraisal the document states at page 33 that: "The omission of any particular building, feature, view or space within this appraisal should not be taken to imply that it is of no interest".

The proposed development will 'preserve' the conservation area due to it essentially being a like for like alteration of the existing windows and doors. I note that the proposed window and door alterations will also enhance the conservation area. Old, worn down white timber windows shall be replaced with high quality white / cream UPVC windows, creating a more positive aesthetic to the dwelling as well as a more energy efficient alternative to the existing. The alteration of the front door and utility door to black timber composite would not create a negative visual impact on the dwelling, in particular to the utility door which is already a dark brown colour. I note that the existing porch doors and sidelights being removed from the principal elevation of the dwelling is considered as minor, thus meaning that it would not detrimentally impact the visual aesthetic of the principal elevation.

The site is not detailed as a 'positive building' on the Figure 4 – Oakamoor Spatial Analysis map, indicating that it does not necessarily have special historic or architectural interest. The principal elevation in particular would be in view from the aforementioned highly important viewpoint of the village (the bridge), located to the South of the site. I note that although the proposed window alterations would be on all elevations of the dwelling, they would be like for like with the existing windows, in terms of their design and colour. Although the material would change from timber to UPVC, the proposed UPVC is of a high quality and would not detract from the appearance of the dwelling. Therefore, it is considered that the proposed window and door alterations to the existing dwellinghouse would not adversely affect the "spacious setting" and visual character of the conservation area.

Design

Policy DC1 seeks to ensure that all development is well designed and of a high quality, contributing to local distinctiveness and harmonising with sense of place. The Council's Design SPD outlines the Council's expectations in respect of design and states that windows and doors are among the most important features of an elevation. Additionally, it states that all window and door replacements should relate to the age and style of the property as well as to the local context. The proposed development consists of window and door alterations on all elevations of the dwelling.

The site comprises a more modern dwellinghouse within the area. As per the Heritage Statement submitted, the building is one of a number of 20th Century developments on the East side of the Brook. Thus, its historic value to the area is reduced, demonstrated by it not holding the status of a 'positive building'. The proposed window and door alterations would be positively integrated into the existing

dwelling and surrounding area, through their like for like design and choice of material; reflecting the character and appearance of the existing dwelling.

The proposed window and door alterations would be on all elevations of the dwelling. All windows and doors would be like for like with the existing windows and doors in terms of their design, retaining both the glazing bars and mould detail. The only alteration to the windows and doors is that they would be double glazed; moreover this would not create a hugely different visual impact. Furthermore, they would be a better barrier for heat retention of the dwelling and therefore, be more environmentally sustainable. Thus, the window and door alterations would not be of any harm to the individual character of the dwelling, or the character of the wider conservation area. As per the Heritage Statement submitted, a number of properties within the immediate vicinity of the site already have UPVC windows installed. Thus, it is clear that the change in material from painted timber to UPVC would not impact the wider setting of the conservation area.

Initially, materials used in the construction of the proposed window alterations would not have matched those used in the construction of the existing dwelling. Agate Grey (RAL 7038) uPVC was originally proposed to be used in the construction of the proposed replacement windows. Agate grey would have conflicted with the existing white painted timber windows, which are a distinctive feature of the dwelling. As the site is within the conservation area, this increases the importance of retaining existing details of buildings, thus as the existing windows are a white / cream colour, it would be ideal that this colour is retained. This colour change is therefore not considered sensitive to the dwelling, detracting from its character. Revised details have since been submitted, changing the colour of the proposed windows to white / cream. The proposed replacement doors will be finished in Black (RAL 9005), which would be considered acceptable, especially given that the existing utility door is dark brown in colour. Therefore, the materials are now considered appropriate in relation to the existing dwellinghouse, as well as the surrounding street scene. Thus, the proposed materials would match the existing materials and harmonise with the surrounding street scene, not detracting from the character of the original estate.

The proposal, by virtue of its size, scale and siting maintains the character of the existing dwelling and area. The proposal would therefore accord with the provisions of local plan policy DC1 and section 12 of the NPPF in this regard.

Amenity

Paragraph 127 f) of the NPPF seeks to secure a high standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants. Local Plan Policy DC1 requires development to achieve a satisfactory relationship to adjacent development and to not cause unacceptable effects by reason of visual intrusion, overlooking, shadowing, overbearing effect, noise, light pollution or other adverse impacts on local character and amenity.

The application site is bound by Brambley Dell, Cotton Dell to the South-West. The neighbours at Brookfield, Cotton Dell are located to the South-East, across the highway from the site. The Glen, Carr Bank is to the North-West, separated from the

site by the Cotton Brook. As the window and door alterations will be on all elevations of the dwellinghouse, assessment of amenity impact will therefore be required on the neighbouring dwellinghouses to the sides and front of the site.

Consideration has been given regarding whether the proposed works would cause a detrimental impact on the privacy amenity of the aforementioned neighbours. I note that all window and door alterations will be like for like in positioning to the existing dwellinghouse, thus the proportion of glazing on the dwelling will remain exactly the same as the existing dwelling. Therefore, no additional windows will be added as part of the proposed works. Consequently, no privacy amenity impact will occur, as nothing will be different in terms of the fenestration.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

In consideration of all of the above, the application is recommended for approval. Due to the application having no adverse effect upon neighbour or street scene amenity and the proposal is considered to be acceptable in the context of the surrounding conservation area. Therefore, the proposed replacement windows and doors are recommended for approval, subject to compliance with all conditions.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE

Case Officer: Hannah Hollins

Recommendation Date: 09/03/2022

X 

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council