

DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2021/0381
Valid 10/06/2021

62 FOLD LANE
BIDDULPH

**PROPOSED EXTENSION AND
ALTERATIONS TO EXISTING
BUNGALOW**

(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)

MAIN ISSUES

- Whether the proposal comprises an exception to inappropriate development in the Green Belt.
- Impact on the character and appearance of the existing dwellinghouse and the surrounding area.
- Impact on neighbouring amenity.
- Impact on highway safety.

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The application site comprises a detached bungalow constructed of brick with a plain clay tile hipped roof. The dwellinghouse has been extended to the rear with a large, single storey flat roofed extension. The bungalow is set back from the road by a front garden that is paved and utilised as off-street parking.

The application site forms part of a ribbon of development that occupies the northern side of Fold Lane. There are a mix of bungalows, dormer bungalows and two-storey houses along the road. Open fields are located to the rear of the application site and on the opposite side of the road to the front. The application site is located in the North Staffordshire Green Belt.

PROPOSAL

Full planning permission is sought to alter the existing roof from a hip to a ridge and increase the height of the roof in order to create an additional bedroom with en-suite within the resulting roof space.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan (Adopted Sept 2020)

- SS1 Development Principles
 - 1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
- SS2 Settlement Hierarchy
- SS10 Other Rural Areas Strategy
- DC1 Design Considerations
- T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Paragraph(s) 1 - 14

Section(s) 4, 12, 13

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

None

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 20/07/2021

Neighbour consultation period ends: 13/07/2021

Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments: None

Town / Parish Comments: Biddulph Town Council recommend approval subject to valid neighbour concerns.

Severn Trent Water: The application site is outside our area therefore we have no comment to make.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Procedural Matters

The submitted Site Plan (4752-01-05) is incorrect. The proposed development has been shown on No. 58 Fold Lane, rather than the application site. This drawing has therefore been disregarded and only the Site Location Plan has been used (4752-01-06).

Principle of Development

Paragraph 11 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF, 2021) promotes a 'presumption in favour of sustainable development'. For decision takers this means (c) approving development proposals that accord with an up-to-date development plan without delay; or (d) where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are more important for determining the application are out-of-date, granting permission, unless: i) the application of policies in the Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed; or ii) any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in the Framework taken as a whole.

Paragraph 8 of the NPPF (2021) identifies three dimensions to sustainable development as being economic, social and environmental. In accordance with

policies SS1 and 1a of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan, the Council will expect all new development to make a positive contribution towards the sustainability of communities and to protecting, and where possible, enhancing the environment. When considering development proposals, the Council will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the NPPF (2021).

The application site is located in the Open Countryside and Green Belt whereby policy SS10 of the Local Plan (2020) is applicable. Policy SS10 states that these rural areas will provide only for development that has an essential need to be located in the countryside, supports the rural diversification and sustainability of the rural areas, promotes sustainable tourism or enhances the countryside.

Part (1) of policy SS10 seeks to meet housing requirements and specific need by allowing extensions or additional domestic outbuildings to existing dwellings provided they are appropriate in scale and design and do not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwelling and the character of the rural area. The Council will assess schemes having regard to the original dwelling, in cases where cumulative change has occurred. This is considered below in the context of Green Belt and design policies.

Green Belt

The application site is located in the Green Belt whereby policy SS10 of the Local Plan (2020) and chapter 13 of the NPPF (2021) are applicable. Part (6) of policy SS10 states that strict control will continue to be exercised over inappropriate development within the Green Belt, allowing only for exceptions as defined by Government policy.

The proposal is for the alteration to the bungalow's existing roof in order to create additional living accommodation within the resulting roof space. Paragraph 149 of the NPPF (2021) outlines that the construction of new buildings should be regarded as inappropriate in the Green Belt unless it meets an exception. Such an exception applicable to this application is (c) the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building.

Neither the Local Plan nor the NPPF (2021) provide a definition of what is regarded as being '*disproportionate*' for the purposes of Green Belt policy however, previous policy guidance considered a development resulting in a 30% increase in the size of the original building as being acceptable.

The existing bungalow has been previously extended to the rear by a single storey flat roofed extension that extends 6 metres from the original dwellinghouse and occupies the full width of the property. No planning approval is held by the Local Planning Authority for this extension however, aerial photographs indicate that it was in-situ in 2011 and therefore it is immune from enforcement action. The original dwellinghouse has therefore been extended by an increase of 79% in floorspace. Added together with the proposed first floor extension, this will equate to an increase in floorspace of 123%. The proposal will also result in the ridge of the bungalow

increasing and the bulk/volume of the bungalow significantly increasing over and above the original bungalow.

The proposed extension together with the existing rear extension will result in significant additions to the original dwellinghouse. The proposed development will therefore comprise disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. The proposed extension will comprise inappropriate development in the Green Belt.

Paragraph 147 of the NPPF (2021) states that *'inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances'*. No Very Special Circumstances have been advanced by the applicant.

The planning agent submitted a revised drawing to reduce the scale of the proposed extension. However, the existing extension already comprises disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building and therefore any further extensions to the bungalow, no matter how small, will comprise inappropriate development in the Green Belt. The revised drawing therefore does not overcome the concerns raised and the planning agent has confirmed that they wish for the application to be determined in respect of the original, rather than the revised, drawings.

For these reasons the proposed extension will be contrary to policy SS10 of the Local Plan (2020) and chapter 13 of the NPPF (2021).

Design

Policy DC1 refers to design and seeks to secure development of a high quality which is designed to add value to the area and to respect the site and its surroundings. New development should promote a positive sense of place and identity through its scale, density, layout, siting, landscaping, character and appearance.

Paragraph 130 of the NPPF (2021) requires the design of a development to add to the overall quality of an area, by being sympathetic to local character and by being visually attractive as a result of good architecture.

The Council's Design Guide SPD outlines the Council's expectations in respect of design and states that extensions should harmonise with the parent building. An extension should respect the dominance of the original building and be subordinate to it in terms of its size and massing. In respect of alterations it states that *'alterations need to be undertaken with care. Insensitive changes can easily spoil a building...The aim is to revitalise the building without altering its fundamental character'*.

It is proposed to replace the existing hipped roof of the bungalow with a pitched roof. In order to create the necessary headroom, the ridge of the roof will increase in height by 1.25 metres. 2no. rooflights will be positioned in the front elevation and a dormer window will be positioned in the rear elevation. The gable walls of the roof

will be constructed of materials to match the existing dwellinghouse and the roof will be covered in plain clay tiles.

The increase in the ridge height of the roof results in a 'top-heavy' design that is out of proportion with the original ground floor of the bungalow. The proposed extension does not harmonise with the original bungalow and is not subordinate in terms of its size and massing. The design of the proposed extension is therefore considered to have a detrimental effect on the character and appearance of the existing dwellinghouse.

The application site forms part of a ribbon of development along the northern side of Fold Lane. The dwellinghouses along the lane comprise a mix of property types, sizes and designs. Fold Lane rises from west to east and the dwellinghouses along the lane have been designed so that each property is higher than its western neighbour, creating a stepped design. The proposed extension will compromise this design as the proposed increase in ridge height will result in the property being significantly taller than the bungalow to the west (No. 64) and taller than the dormer bungalow to the east (No. 60). The proposed extension is therefore considered to have an unacceptable impact on the character and appearance of the street scene.

It is for these reasons that the design of the proposed extension is considered contrary to policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020) and the NPPF (2021).

Amenity

Policy DC1 and paragraph 130(f) of the NPPF (2021) seek to secure development that protects amenity, including residential amenity, in terms of satisfactory daylight, sunlight, outlook, privacy and soft landscaping.

To the east of the application site is a detached dormer bungalow, No. 60 Fold Lane. 3no. dormer windows are positioned within the western roof slope that face towards the application site. The Planning Officer visited the neighbouring property and can confirm that the central dormer window is the only window that serves a bedroom/study. The dormer windows positioned towards the front and rear of the roof slope are secondary windows to bedrooms that are also served by an additional principal window within the front and rear gable ends.

The proposed extension will result in the hipped roof of the bungalow changing to a pitched roof and the ridge height of the roof will increase from 5.40 metres to 6.85 metres; an increase of 1.25 metres. Concern was raised by the Planning Officer regarding the potential impact the proposed roof alterations would have on the neighbouring property's middle bedroom/study window and therefore a street scene drawing was requested. This was duly submitted.

The street scene drawing indicates that the proposed ridge height will be higher than the roof of No. 60 Fold Lane. The change from a hipped roof to a pitched roof will also result in a gable wall being sited 2.3 metres from the principle bedroom/study window within the western roof slope of No. 60 Fold Lane. The separation distance will be significantly less than stated within the Space About Dwellings SPD. It is for these reasons that the proposed extension will result in an overbearing impact and a

loss of light to the neighbouring property. The proposed extension will therefore have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity and will be contrary to policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020) and the NPPF (2021).

To the west of the application site is a detached bungalow, No. 64 Fold Lane. No windows are located in the side elevation of No. 64 that face towards the application site and the proposed roof alteration will comply with the 45-degree guideline. A dormer window will be positioned in the rear roof slope that will afford views over the rear garden of No. 64. However, these views will be oblique and No. 64 has a large rear garden and therefore it is not considered that the proposed dormer window will significantly affect the privacy of this property. It is therefore considered that the proposed extension will not adversely affect the amenity of No. 64 Fold Lane.

No dwellinghouses are located to the front or rear of the application site.

Highway Safety

Policies DC1 and T1 seek to achieve a level of parking and an access that is appropriate to the development it serves.

The existing bungalow has 2no. bedrooms. The proposed roof alteration will result in the creation of a third bedroom. In respect of the Parking Standards contained at Appendix 2 of the Local Plan (2020), 2no. off-street parking spaces are required to serve a 3 bedroom dwellinghouse.

The front garden of the bungalow has been paved to create an area of off-street parking. Sufficient space exists for the parking of the 2no. vehicles within the front garden, in compliance with the Parking Standards.

It is therefore not considered that the proposed extension will have a detrimental effect on highway safety. The development will therefore comply with policies DC1 and T1 of the Local Plan (2020) and the NPPF (2021).

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

The dwellinghouse has already been significantly extended and the proposed extension will further exacerbate this situation. The proposed extension, together with the existing extension, will comprise a disproportionate addition over and above the size of the original dwellinghouse. The proposed extension therefore comprises inappropriate development in the Green Belt.

Paragraph 147 of the NPPF (2021) states that *'inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances'*. No Very Special Circumstances have been advanced by the applicant. The proposed development is therefore contrary to policy SS10 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan (2020) and chapter 13 of the NPPF (2021).

The increase in the ridge height of the roof results in a 'top-heavy' design that is out of proportion with the original ground floor of the bungalow. The proposed extension

does not harmonise with the original bungalow and is not subordinate in terms of its size and massing. The design of the proposed extension is therefore considered to have a detrimental effect on the character and appearance of the existing dwellinghouse, contrary to policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020), the Design Guide SPD and the NPPF (2021).

The application site forms part of a ribbon of development along the northern side of Fold Lane. Fold Lane rises from west to east and the dwellinghouses along the lane have been designed so that the each property is higher than its western neighbour, creating a stepped design. The proposed extension will compromise this design as the increase in ridge height will result in the property being significantly taller than the bungalow to the west (No. 64) and taller than the dormer bungalow to the east (No. 60). The proposed extension is therefore considered to have an unacceptable impact on the character and appearance of the street scene, contrary to policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020), the Design Guide SPD and the NPPF (2021).

The proposed ridge height will be higher than the roof of No. 60 Fold Lane. The change from a hipped roof to a pitched roof will result in a gable wall being sited 2.3 metres from the principle bedroom/study window within the western roof slope of No. 60 Fold Lane. The separation distance will be significantly less than stated within the Space About Dwellings SPD. The proposed extension will result in an overbearing impact and a loss of light to the neighbouring property, contrary to policy DC1 of the Local Plan (2020) and the NPPF (2021).

As such the application is recommended for refusal.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION: REFUSE

Case Officer: Ailsa Berry

Recommendation Date: 20/10/2021

X 

Signed by: Ben Haywood

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council