DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2020/0014 **Valid 09/01/2020**	**FIR GROVE FIR BOB HOLLINGTON**	**RESUBMISSION OF PREVIOUSLY REFUSED APPLICATION SMD/2019/0186. AMENDED SCHEME TO PROVIDE A SINGLE STOREY EXTENSION WITH A SHOWER ROOM AND ENTRANCE LOBBY** **(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)**

MAIN ISSUES

- Impact on the character and appearance of the host dwelling;
- Amenity; and
- Highway safety.

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

The application site comprises a parcel of land approximately 50m to the west of Fir Bob Lane, Hollington. Fir Bob Lane runs northwards from Main Road, which serves Hollington village and is also a public right of way. The site is situated outside of the development boundary in the open countryside.

The site itself is accessed via a narrow private single track and contains 'Fir Grove', a three bedroom two storey semi-detached property with its associated residential curtilage. The curtilage is made up of an area of ground to the east, utilised for vehicle parking and turning, and a garden area to the south. The rear (southern) elevation is characterised by an unsympathetic flat roof single storey extension which was added following the granting of planning permission in 1983 and dormer windows in the main house at first floor eaves level. The extension is constructed in stone work with the rear elevation being finished in a light brown render.

PROPOSAL

This application seeks to address the reasons for refusal of planning reference SMD/2019/0186 and proposes the construction of a single storey extension to the south elevation of the dwellinghouse and seeks to replace existing flat roof dormer windows with dual pitched dormer windows.

Planning reference SMD/2019/0186 sought consent for *'proposed extension to enlarge bedroom and provide en-suite facilities and to replace existing flat roof dormers with pitched roofs'*. The proposed extension comprised of a two storey extension that was proposed to extend beyond the south and east elevations of the

dwellinghouse. The application was refused and subsequently dismissed at Appeal on the following grounds:

1. The proposed development, by virtue of its scale, layout, massing, visual appearance and its relationship with the existing dwelling, constitutes poor design, which significantly and demonstrably harms the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and the wider rural landscape contrary to Policies SS1, SS6, SS6c, R2 and DC1 of the Staffordshire Moorlands Core Strategy, Paragraph 127 of the NPPF and advice in the Staffordshire Moorlands Design Guide. The application thereby constitutes an unsustainable form of development, contrary to Policy SS1a of the Staffordshire Moorlands Core Strategy and paragraph 11 of the NPPF.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Core Strategy Development Plan Document (Adopted 2014)

S01 Spatial Objectives
SS1 Development Principles
SS1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
SS6 Rural Areas
SS6c Other Rural Areas Area Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
R2 Rural Housing
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

Emerging Staffordshire Moorlands Local Plan

The Council agreed to publish the Local Plan Submission Version for representations in February 2018. At this point, the Council agreed that the Local Plan was “sound”. Formal representations were then invited from residents, businesses and other stakeholders to provide them with the opportunity to support or challenge the soundness or legal compliance of the Local Plan. This stage in the process followed three previous public consultations since 2015 which had informed the preparation of the Local Plan alongside a comprehensive evidence base.

In June 2018, the Council subsequently agreed to submit the Local Plan Submission Version to the Secretary of State for examination. An examination in public is ongoing in order to determine whether the Local Plan is sound and legally compliant. Hearing sessions were conducted in October 2018 and the Inspector issued his initial post-hearing advice in January 2019 which set out some actions for the Council and a range of modifications that would be necessary to make the plan sound. The full schedule of modifications was agreed by the Council and the subject of public consultation between 18th September 2019 and 31st October 2019. The schedule consisted of modifications that the Inspector has deemed necessary to make the Local Plan sound. Following the consultation, the Inspector concluded that further hearing sessions were necessary to consider; proposals for safeguarded land at Gillow Heath in Biddulph, housing land supply, Local Green Spaces in Cheddleton

(Ox Pasture), Biddulph (Dorset Drive and implications for the emerging neighbourhood plan) and Blythe Bridge. They were held on 4th and 5th February.

On 27th February, the Inspector issued his post hearing advice. Key recommendations in the letter include:

- The proposed safeguarded land at Gillow Health, Biddulph should be removed. Neither should the site be allocated for housing as requested by the landowners as the case for exceptional circumstances has not ben met. The land will remain Green Belt as per the Local Plan Submission Version agreed by the Council in June 2018
- No further housing allocations in Biddulph are required
- No further amendments to the housing trajectory are required aside from pushing back the predicted commencement of the Wharf Road, Biddulph site (excluding BDNEW) until 2022/23.
- Monitoring of housing supply will determine if a full or partial Local Plan review is required within 5 years
- Land at Ox Pasture (Cheddleton) and Dorset Drive (Biddulph) should revert back to the Local Green Space designations as per the Local Plan Submission Version as agreed by the Council in June 2018.
- Other modifications were considered during the recent hearings sessions are necessary to make the plan sound, including; updating neighbourhood area housing requirements (Policy SS4) to reflect the latest monitoring data, updating the employment land area for the Tunstall Road allocation to reflect the masterplan and other adjustments to the wording of Policy SS4 and Policy DC2.

No further representations will be sought by the Inspector. As such, the Local Plan policies as proposed to be modified in September 2019 along with the Inspector recommended revisions (February 2020) provide a strong indication of the final policies likely to be adopted in the Local Plan. The Inspector's final report is expected within 2 months and will reflect the post hearing advice. The Council will be able to consider the adoption of the Local Plan at this point. As such, the plan is at a very advanced stage of preparation with some of the key outstanding objections now having been resolved following the February 2020 hearing sessions.

In this context, the Council's position on the weight to be given to the policies contained in the Local Plan Submission Version in terms of the three criteria set out in Paragraph 48 of the NPPF is considered below:

- The stage of preparation – the Local Plan is now at an advanced stage of preparation as the main modifications have been subject to consultation

- The extent to which there are unresolved objections to relevant policies this varies depending on the policy in question – the Inspector wishes to explore outstanding objections on a limited number of issues at the February hearing sessions further before drawing conclusions.

- The degree of consistency of the relevant policies in the emerging plan to this Framework – policies have been modified to address soundness issues identified by the Inspector to date. It is the Council's view that the policies (as modified) are consistent with national policy. The Inspector has yet to draw final conclusions, particularly on the matters subject to further hearing sessions.

Given the above, the majority of policies (as modified) can be given substantial weight.

Emerging Policies:

SS1 Development Principles
1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
SS2 Settlement Hierarchy
SS10 Other Rural Areas Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Paragraph(s) 1 - 14
Section(s) 12

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SMD/1981/0521	Erection of detached dwelling Permitted Development
SMD/1983/0329	Replacement of existing extension with dining room and utility room Approved
SMD/2019/0186	Proposed extension to enlarge bedroom and provide en-suite facilities. Also replace existing flat roof dormer with pitched roof Refused – Appeal dismissed

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 01.04.2020
Neighbour consultation period ends: 03.02.2020
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments

No comments received.

Town / Parish Comments

No comments received.

Severn Trent Water

No objection and no conditions recommended.

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development

Paragraph 11 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) promotes a 'presumption in favour of sustainable development'. For decision takers this means (c) approving development proposals that accord with an up-to-date development plan without delay; or (d) where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are more important for determining the application are out-of-date, granting permission, unless: i) the application of policies in the Framework that protect areas or assets of particular importance provides a clear reason for refusing the development proposed; or ii) Any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the policies in the Framework taken as a whole.

Paragraph 8 of the NPPF identifies three dimensions to sustainable development as being economic, social and environmental.

In accordance with policies SS1 and SS1a of the Staffordshire Moorlands Core Strategy the Council will expect all new development to make a positive contribution towards the sustainability of communities and to protecting, and where possible enhancing the environment. When considering development proposals the Council will take a positive approach that reflects the presumption in favour of sustainable development contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).

The application site falls within the Countryside, outside of a defined settlement or infill boundary. In accordance with policy SS6c, in such locations development is restricted to that which *inter alia* meets an essential local need which includes allowing for extensions to existing building in accordance with policies R1 and R2. Policy R1 states that appropriate development should not harm the rural character and environmental quality of the area by virtue of scale, nature and level of activity involved. Policy R2 permits extensions to existing dwellings provided they are appropriate in scale and design and do not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwellinghouse and character of the rural area.

Design

Policy DC1 refers to design and seeks to secure development of a high quality which is designed to add value to the area and to respect the site and its surroundings. New development should promote a positive sense of place and identity through its scale, density, layout, siting, landscaping, character and appearance.

Paragraph 127 of the National Planning Policy Framework requires the design of a development to add to the overall quality of an area, by being sympathetic to local character and by being visually attractive as a result of good architecture.

The Council's Design SPD outlines the Council's expectations in respect of design and states that extensions should harmonise with the parent building. An extension should respect the dominance of the original building and be subordinate to it in terms of its size and massing.

The proposed development comprises the construction of a single storey extension that is to be located on the east elevation of the dwellinghouse. It has been determined by the Council and the Planning Inspectorate that the east elevation constitutes the principal elevation of the dwellinghouse. The extension is to project 3m and will measure 3.5m in width and is to serve as an entrance porch and shower room. A dual pitched roof is proposed that reflects the pitch of the existing roof form. External building materials are to comprise of stone to the walls and Staffordshire blue tiles to the roof. Fenestration is to be upvc, also to match the existing.

The dwellinghouse containes 3 no. flat roof dormer windows that break the eaves line (1no. on the north elevation and 2 no. on the south elevation). It is proposed to replace the flat roof design with a dual pitched roof of appropriate proportions and material palette.

The extensions are significantly smaller than those refused by virtue of planning reference SMD/2019/0186 and present a proportionate form of development that respects the dominance of the existing dwellinghouse and principal elevation. An acceptable material palette is proposed and the extension is considered to be of an acceptable design and appearance, in accordance with policy DC1.

Amenity

Core Strategy policy DC1 and paragraph 127f) of the National Planning Policy Framework seek to secure development that protects the amenity, including residential amenity, in terms of satisfactory daylight, sunlight, outlook, privacy and soft landscaping.

Sufficient distance exists between the development and the nearest residential property to not raise undue concern, particularly having regard to the single storey nature of the extension and the fact that it does not include "habitable" accommodation..

Highway Safety

Policy DC1 and T1 seek to achieve parking and access appropriate tot the development it serves. The proposed development would not result in the loss of

existing on-site provision, nor would it result in the provision of additional bedroom accommodation. As such it is not considered that the development would result in harm to highway safety.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE

This application is considered to adequately accord with the relevant policies contained in the Staffordshire Moorlands Core Strategy and National Planning Policy Framework. As such a recommendation of approval is provided.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : Approve

Case Officer: Lisa Howard
Recommendation Date: 20.04.2020

X B.J. Haywood

Signed by: Ben Haywood
On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council