DELEGATED DECISION REPORT

SMD/2016/0501 **Valid 30/08/2016**	**THE GRANGE** **WHISTON EAVES LANE** **WHISTON**	**PROPOSED TWO STOREY REAR EXTENSION** **(FULL - HOUSEHOLDER)**

MAIN ISSUES

- Design
- Heritage
- Street scene

DESCRIPTION OF SITE

Some 300m south of the village of Whiston this two storey brick and stone property stands alone on a slight rise on the east side of Whiston Eaves Lane at a point where there is also a rise in the lane itself. The location is rural and but for the public road is bounded by fields. The property is generally prominent to Whiston Eaves Lane.

A windowed side elevation looks out SW over the road separated only by the gently sloped grass verge. The main front of the house, angled slightly away from the road, faces SE looking over a garden enclosure parallel to the road. The rear of the property includes a two storey gabled outrigger which extends the road-side elevation. This extension is of brick with dressed stone quoins. Its windowless rear gable is especially prominent to the road when approaching from the NW. Not readily seen from the road is a single storey rear lean-to built out from the main house along the inner side elevation of the outrigger.

Access to the property is via a short gravel lane which curves in off the public road from a point some 30m to the NW to reach a gravel yard area. There are two small detached stone outbuildings of evident age and character to the N of the yard forming a group with the house. The NE side of the house furthest in from the road is attached to a stone barn. With the exception of the small single storey rear extension the house and the associated buildings occupy a footprint which had been established historically at least by the 1887 OS map. It is likely that in its origins the property is significantly older but with alterations, perhaps including elements of re-building, having occurred at various dates both pre and post 1887. An 1837 OS document held by the British Library and available on-line shows a building present at the location consistent with that of 1887 and the present day.

The location is within the Dissected Sandstone Highland Fringe Landscape Character Type, ranked as High quality (level 4 out of 5 where 5 is highest) in the Staffordshire county-wide context.

The property is listed in the Staffordshire Historic Environment Record (HER) in which it is described as a farmstead likely to have been established between 1775 and 1834 and appearing to survive relatively unaltered.

PROPOSAL

The proposal is to build a second gabled outrigger of two storeys alongside the first in place of the current single storey extension. A very slightly revised plan was submitted after the applicant was advised of concerns with the first. The proposed extension would project 5.9m in total and 1.3m further than the projection of the existing rear outrigger. It would have a width of 4.8m in the gable thereby overlapping the gable of the existing outrigger. The proposal is to join its outer (NE) side wall flush with the NE side wall of the original house. To do this it is proposed to cut out the quoin stones of the house and re-use these in the extension. The extension would be 'toothed' into the wall of the existing house. First floor windows are proposed essentially in keeping with those of the existing property. At ground floor the applicant is seeking to maximise daylight with a long window range in both the rear and side elevations. A new door would be positioned centrally in the window range of the new gable end facing NW.

RELEVANT LOCAL AND NATIONAL PLANNING POLICIES

Core Strategy Development Plan Document (Adopted 2014)

S01 Spatial Objectives
SS1 Development Principles
SS1a Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
SS6c Other Rural Areas Strategy
SS7 Churnet Valley Area Strategy
DC1 Design Considerations
DC2 The Historic Environment
R1 Rural Diversification
R2 Rural Housing
T1 Development and Sustainable Transport

National Planning Policy Framework

Paragraphs 1 to 17
Sections 7 – Requiring Good Design
12 – Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment

SITE HISTORY / RELEVANT PREVIOUS APPLICATIONS

SM93-0204 single storey extensions to dwelling and use of barn as a granny annex, involving the installation of dormer windows and a two storey extension. Creation of additional garage – **Refused** on grounds of scale and design resulting in the loss of the essential character of the traditional building.

CONSULTATIONS

Publicity

Site Notice expiry date: 19th October 2016
Neighbour consultation period ends: N/A – no immediate neighbours.
Press Advert: N/A

Public Comments
None

Town / Parish Comments
Kingsley Parish Council – support

OFFICER COMMENTS

Principle of Development
Policy R2 establishes the principle of development as follows: "Other than sites allocated for housing development in the Site Allocations DPD, only the following forms of housing development will be permitted in the rural areas outside the settlement and infill boundaries of the town and the villages:" and lists, relevant to this application, "Extensions to existing dwellings provided they are appropriate in scale and design and do not have a detrimental impact on the existing dwelling and the character of the rural area."

R1 states, inter alia: "All development in the rural areas outside the development boundaries of the towns and villages will be assessed according to the extent to which it enhances the character, appearance and biodiversity of the countryside, promotes the sustainable diversification of the rural economy, facilitates economic activity, meets a rural community need and sustains the historic environment. Appropriate development should not harm the rural character and environmental quality of the area or any sites designated for their nature conservation, or historical interest by virtue of the scale, nature and level of activity involved and the type and amount of traffic generated or by other effects such as noise and pollution."

SS7 states, inter alia: "Any development should be of a scale and nature and of a high standard of design which conserves and enhances the heritage, landscape and biodiversity of the area and demonstrates strong sustainable development and environmental management principles. The consideration of landscape character will be paramount in all development proposals in order to protect and conserve locally distinctive qualities and sense of place and to maximize opportunities for restoring, strengthening and enhancing distinctive landscape features."

Design
Policy DC1 seeks high quality design complementary to the area and in line with the Councils adopted design guide. This sets out that extensions should be subordinate to the existing building so that the original building dominates; size and shape should respect the height and proportions of the existing house; ridge height should be lower than that of the existing; and, referring to side extensions, point 4 is that these should be set back relative to the front elevation, and whilst this is a rear extension it is in effect a side extension of the existing outrigger and the principle is considered relevant to this proposal. A particular feature of this property is the use of large dressed stone quoins on the wall corners. The proposal seeks to emulate this but would do so by using quoin stones removed from the existing building which would then be built over or around.

Typically in older properties windows will either not be present or be very small in gable walls as is the case with this property where the gable of the main house facing the road has only three small irregularly positioned windows and the gable of the rear outrigger is windowless. The current proposal includes very large openings characteristic of modern suburban dwellings which would be out of keeping with the age and style of this property.

Amenity
No conflicts with neighbour amenity. There would be harm to public amenity in terms of the visibility of the development from the public road and the extent to which the development would appear out of kilter with the scale and form of the existing property.

CONCLUSION / PLANNING BALANCE
The extension as proposed is over large and, in the prominent views of the rear of the building visible from the public road, would dominate the existing building rather than being subordinate to it. In design, in particular in the size and distribution of windows, the extension would be out of keeping with the existing property and with properties of this age and character in the area generally.

Stone built farm houses are listed as a key characteristic of the Dissected Sandstone Highland Fringe Landscape Character Type as identified in the Landscape and Settlement Character Assessment – a supporting evidence document to the Local Plan. The commentary states under Landscape Planning Guidelines that "changes that detract from local character and over urbanise properties and their settings should be avoided".

Due to the evident age and character of the buildings at Whiston Grange it is appropriate to regard the existing property as a non-designated heritage asset as discussed at paragraph 135 of the NPPF which calls for a balanced judgment based on the scale of the harm and the significance of the heritage asset. Although no heritage assessment was required to be submitted with the application its details as recorded in the Staffordshire HER are publicly available and provide a proportionate minimum level of information with which to assess this proposal.

The proposal is contrary to the Council's policies for rural building extensions SS6c, R1 and R2, and in terms of design, DC1 and should be refused on these grounds. There are further strong grounds in the building's status as a non designated heritage asset recorded in the Staffordshire HER and the proposal is therefore contrary to policy DC2.

The location in the Churnet Valley Master Plan area adds further weight to the assessment against this proposal on design and heritage grounds as contrary to Policy SS7.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION : Refuse

Case Officer: Arne Swithenbank
Recommendation Date: 29th December 2016

X B.J. Haywood

Signed by: Haywood, Ben

On behalf of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council